



Provided by the author(s) and NUI Galway in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite the published version when available.

Title	Re-thinking Missionary Catholicism for the Early Modern Era
Author(s)	Forrestal, Alison; Smith, Seán
Publication Date	2016-09
Publication Information	Forrestal, Alison, & Smith, Seán. (2016). Re-thinking Missionary Catholicism for the Early Modern Era. In Alison Forrestal & Seán Smith (Eds.), <i>The Frontiers of Mission Perspectives on Early Modern Missionary Catholicism</i> . Leiden: Brill.
Publisher	Brill
Link to publisher's version	http://www.brill.com/products/book/frontiers-mission#TOC_1
Item record	http://hdl.handle.net/10379/6462

Downloaded 2022-08-14T21:36:26Z

Some rights reserved. For more information, please see the item record link above.



Re-thinking Missionary Catholicism for the Early Modern Era

Alison Forrestal and Sean Smith

Historians have long debated the signifying features of early modern Catholicism. Their thematic tallies of the decisive shifts the Catholic denomination experienced in this era have traditionally included the subjects of church abuse, counter-reform, and militancy, since Luther's bold campaign against the programme of indulgences worked out by Leo X in 1515 to finance the rebuilding of St Peter's in Rome tends to focus interest on the causes of fracture within traditional religion.¹ However, a topic deserving at least equal attention is the creative capacities evident in the Catholic church during this period, for the ingenuity of this denomination in the face of increasing challenges is just as compelling. Indeed, even before the scandal over indulgences erupted, the church evinced some capacity to seek reform, although this entailed a variety of measures, both negative and positive. In Spain, for instance, the destructive forces of the Inquisition and the rich fruits of mysticism later presented by Theresa of Avila and John of the Cross represented polar extremes of efforts to reactivate religious discipline and purify the church.² Elsewhere, pioneers restructured inherited frameworks in order to restore elements of church life once attacked. In 1630s Paris, Vincent de Paul and his collaborators used confraternal structures to reinvigorate religious dedication and discipline amongst both clergy and laity.³ Gendered roles too were re-assessed, as large numbers of Catholic women all over Europe initiated religious changes that left distinctive marks on the organisation of religious practise.⁴ These demonstrate that, although consolidation and continuity were vital elements in the survival of the Catholic church in the early modern era, significant changes were afoot. Alongside measures and movements developed on the

¹ *Martin Luther*, ed. Gordon Rupp and Benjamin Drewery (London: Edward Arnold, 1970), 15, 17-25.

² Helen Rawlings, *The Spanish Inquisition* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2006), 47-112; Diarmaid MacCulloch, *Reformation. Europe's House Divided, 1490-1700* (London: Penguin, 2003), 58-65; Alison Weber, *Teresa of Avila and the Rhetoric of Femininity* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1996).

³ Pierre Blet, "Vincent de Paul and the Episcopate of France," *Vincentian Heritage Journal* 10, no. 2 (1989), 102-135; Alison Forrestal, "Venues for Clerical Formation in Catholic Reformation Paris: Vincent de Paul and the Tuesday Conferences and Company," *Proceedings of the Western Society for French History* 38 (2010), 44-60.

⁴ Ruth P. Liebowitz, "Virgins in the Service of Christ: The Dispute over an Active Apostolate for Women during the Counter-Reformation," ed. Rosemary Ruether and Eleanor McLaughlin, *Women of Spirit: Female Leadership in the Jewish and Christian Traditions* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1979), 131-52; Merry E. Weisner, *Gender, Church and State in Early Modern Germany* (Essex: Addison Wesley, 1998), 71-78; Barbara B. Diefendorf, *From Penitence to Charity: Pious Women and the Catholic Reformation in Paris* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004); Jennifer Hillman, *Female Piety and the Catholic Reformation in France* (London: Pickering and Chatto, 2014).

continent proper, the extension of the Catholic faith beyond primitive frontiers through bold missionary enterprises constituted another monumental means of change. In these new regions, the agents of the faith came to test traditional boundaries and construct many new ones. In essence, this volume demonstrates that spiritual globalisation did not just transfer the faith and the church across the world, but gave rise to entirely new Catholic landscapes.

The missionary church came to strength in the period when the frontiers of European societies shifted significantly. Promotion of the Christian faith in new dominions, especially in America and Asia, was at first tied to the expansion of kingdoms in the Iberian peninsula. The Portuguese, spurred by the crusading spirit and the lure of gold in Africa, captured the city of Ceuta in 1415. They soon explored the western coasts of Africa, eventually rounding the Cape of Good Hope, and reached India by 1498. In 1500 they made their first landing on the east coast of South America, establishing their initial foothold in the colony of Brazil, a base that would soon form the cornerstone of a great overseas expanse.⁵ In quick succession, the united Spanish crowns of Castile and Aragon sponsored the famous voyage of discovery that would make landfall on the islands of the Caribbean. By the mid-seventeenth century, expeditions that had begun with Christopher Columbus's venture in 1492 extended Spanish sovereignty over Mexico and Peru, and eventually over almost an entire continent.⁶ As the dominance of Spain and Portugal gradually waned, however, rival European powers sought their share of imperial riches. Holland, France and Britain, through their highly ambitious chartered associations of merchants, each garnered multiple footholds in Southeast Asia, India and North America. After hounding Portuguese ships in the Indian Ocean for years, the Dutch conquered the island of Ambon (1605), and then set up in Batavia (1619) and Malacca (1641) in Indonesia. For their part, French and British explorers exploited their initial bases in Virginia (1607) and Québec (1608) to divide continental North America, the Antilles and other islands of the Caribbean between them.⁷ Even on the continent proper, significant changes further confirmed the advent of an 'imperial age'. The Ottoman rulers progressively expanded their domains in the Eastern Mediterranean and Eastern Europe, seizing Belgrade (1521), Hungary (1541), Transylvania (1551-1552) and Cyprus (1571), to name but a few of the new Turkish prizes.⁸

The content of the history of European expansion, however, varies according to theme. Chroniclers of European expansion variously related their accounts of European overseas

⁵ Charles Ralph Boxer, *The Portuguese Seaborne Empire, 1415-1825* (New York: A.A Knopf, 1969).

⁶ Henry Kamen, *Spain's Road to Empire: The Making of a World Power* (London: Allen Lane, Penguin Press 2002).

⁷ F. Mauro, *L'Expansion Européenne (1600-1870)*, (Paris: PUF, 1988), 125-162.

⁸ Peter F. Sugar, *Southeastern Europe under Ottoman Rule, 1354-1804* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1977), 65-72.

expansion to the themes of exploration, conquest and the feats of the famous men and mariners of the era.⁹ Successive scholarly investigations have since turned attention to the impact of European expansion. Unsurprisingly, the commercial roots of early modern navigation have spawned numerous studies on the technological and mercantile aspects of European trade. The fur trade, the spice trade, and the slave trade – to name but a few – wove important new networks of commerce into the economies of European merchant empires, and while it is true that some of these trade exchanges pre-existed early modern navigation, it is also certain that European conquest reorganised local populations, forcing capitalist modes of production onto indigenous societies and converting independent producers and traders into subjugated labourers.¹⁰ The impositions of European travellers also extended to the erection of novel political structures. For example, in their edited collection focusing on Portuguese cities in the early modern period, Liam Matthew Brockey and his colleagues argue that imperial cities were strongly marked by their assimilation to metropolitan forms of government.¹¹ As vice-regencies, governorates, and colonial councils became established, regions previously unknown to Europeans were quickly transformed into structured administrative units of the various powers. However, in their eagerness to conquer the globe, the new arrivals did not solely impose new models of commerce and government on their new dominions. Anthropologists, ethno-historians and cultural historians have begun to subject the story of European impact on world history to closer examination in a number of creative guises. In his deconstruction of traditional imperial narratives, Alfred Crosby underscores the fact that European carried plants, animals, microbes and diseases into conquered territories, unleashing powerful forces of biological change.¹² Still others have deepened the analysis of European presence overseas by examining cross-cultural dependencies and the spread of the capitalist world system.¹³

⁹ For an early perspective see Richard Hakluyt, *Divers Voyages Touching the Discovery of America and Islands Adjacent*, ed. John Winter Jones (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009). European exploration is viewed through biographical accounts of famous mariners in J.M. Cohen, *The Four Voyages of Christopher Columbus* (London: The Cresset Library, 1988) and Samuel Eliot Morison, *Admiral of the Ocean Sea: A Life of Christopher Columbus* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1942). For general perspectives see G.V. Scammell, *The World Encompassed: The First European Maritime Empires, c.800-1650* (London: Methuen, 1981), Daniel J. Boorstin, *The Discoverers* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986), and J.H. Parry, *The Age of Reconnaissance: Discovery, Exploration and Settlement 1450-1650* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1981).

¹⁰ Eric R. Wolf, *Europe and the People without History* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1982); James D. Tracy, *The Rise of Merchant Empires: Long-Distance Trade in the Early Modern World, 1350-1750* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).

¹¹ *Portuguese Colonial Cities in the Early Modern World*, ed. Liam Matthew Brockey (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008).

¹² Alfred W. Crosby, *The Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492* (Westport: Conn: Greenwood, 1972) and *Ecological Imperialism: The Biological Expansion of Europe, 900-1900*, 2nd edition (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

¹³ *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting and Reflecting on the Encounters between European and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era*, ed. Stuart B. Schwartz (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994). For generalist approaches see the works of Anthony Pagden, *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the*

As well as transporting European exemplars of trade, power and ecology, the adventurism of the early modern period brought ideological systems to new frontiers as well, and prime among these was the Catholic faith. Its outward radiation through the voyages of discovery of the sixteenth century is often regarded as a continuation of the expansionism of Catholic Christendom which began about 1000 with the Crusades.¹⁴ However, while there are undoubtedly elements of continuity, especially in the case of Portugal and Spain, the scale and range of Catholicism's evolution in this period was of a new order. In the words of one Franciscan contemporary of the *conquistadores*, the goal that undergirded Europe's expansion in the early modern period was nothing less than the 'universal destruction' of idolatry and heresy, so that the 'final conversion of all the people of the earth to the bosom of the church' might be achieved.¹⁵ To pursue this, the papacy conferred on the Spanish and Portuguese extensive rights over the church in their respective domains (the so-called *Patronato* and *Padroado*), delivering the liberties of episcopal nomination and the responsibility of creating local churches from scratch into the sceptered hands of the Catholic sovereigns. However, while it fell to these monarchies to organise church hierarchies in the new realms, the lion's share of ecclesiastical labour, especially the primordial task of conversion, belonged to the thousands of missionaries recruited to accompany the imperial efforts.

When the Council of Trent was summoned, the idea of providing a blueprint for the church's vast missionary project beyond Europe's frontiers was assuredly alien to its delegates. More focused on doctrinal statements and reform decrees, the ecumenical council was absolutely silent on the world mission of the Catholic church, perhaps because globalising missionary work had already been long in operation before the Council convened in 1545. Consequently, the Council's focus on producing medicinal measures necessary for the wounded European church meant that the main impetus for Catholic missions came from places other than Rome. Some key initiatives, such as the founding of Propaganda Fide in 1622, flowed directly from the papacy's growing desire to centralise reform efforts. The establishment of this Roman dicastery for world missions was a watershed moment for missionary Catholicism; its embracive jurisdiction extended to the regain of those lost to Protestantism as well as to the training and management of an effective missionary corps to

Origins of Comparative Anthropology (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982) and *European Encounters with the New World* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1993).

¹⁴ John France, *The Crusades and the Expansion of Catholic Christendom 1000-1714* (London and New York: Routledge, 2005), 286.

¹⁵ Geronimo de Mendieta, cited in Ronnie Po-chia Hsia, *The World of Catholic Renewal* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 165.

spread the faith amongst those who had never been evangelised.¹⁶ Yet parallel developments, such as the foundation of the Society of Jesus, demonstrated the church's ability to create its missionary arms outside the traditional hierarchical structures. Rooted in small, changing bands of wandering men led first by the founder Ignatius of Loyola, the Society began its life in Spain and France. Formed for the core objective of helping souls through its members' ministry, it counted over 10,000 men by the end of the sixteenth century.¹⁷ While the Society was by no means the exclusive agent of the missionary churches in the early modern era, it has attracted historical interest proportional to its size, visibility and immense global resources. In his definitive history of the Jesuit Portuguese assistancy, Dauril Alden's account unveils the first, largest and wealthiest territorial unit of the ascendant Society, as well as engaging with Charles R. Boxer's now heavily critiqued proposition that the Jesuits constituted the globe's first multinational corporation.¹⁸ The Jesuits' dominance was not, however, limited to the Iberian cases, for Dominique Deslandres argues that they (along with the Capuchins) played the leading role in orientating missionary fervour and in setting missionary methods in the French Empire of the early modern era.¹⁹

Given their size, resources and level of diffusion, the Jesuits were clearly a major force in the church. Moreover, their sophisticated 'networks of information' and their tightly centralised command have bequeathed documentary resources of enormous range for historians of mission, which further explains the attention that they have paid to them. However, their focus on a single religious institute highlights an overarching theoretical problem with the notion that early modern missionary Catholicism was a co-ordinated enterprise. Several historians ground their studies of early modern missionary Catholicism on this very theory of uniformity and unity, even though closer inspection reveals the significant weaknesses of the picture it creates. Luke Clossey premises his examination of the global Jesuit enterprise on the close interaction of European continental and extra-European missions, arguing for an essential unity of mission, whether it was directed to Lutherans in Germany, Catholics in metropolitan

¹⁶ The Congregation was established by the bull *Inscrutabili* on 22 June 1622, see Peter Guilday, "The Sacred Congregation de Propaganda Fide (1622-1922)", *The Catholic Historical Review*, 6, n.4 (Jan., 1921), pp. 478-494.

¹⁷ John W. O'Malley, *The First Jesuits* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 1994), 18.

¹⁸ Dauril Alden, *The Making of an Enterprise, The Society of Jesus in Portugal, Its Empire, and Beyond 1540-1750* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 33-34; Charles R. Boxer, *Portuguese India in the Mid-Seventeenth Century* (Delhi, 1980), 49-50; *Empires and Autonomy: Moments in the History of Globalization*, eds. Stephen Streeter, John Weaver, William D. Coleman (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 11-12; *The First Portuguese Colonial Empire*, ed. M.D.D Newitt (Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 1986), 93;

¹⁹ Dominique Deslandres, *Croire et faire Croire* (Paris: Fayard, 2003), 78-79. The Jesuits' foothold in North America is similarly explored in Carl J. Ekberg, *French Roots in the Illinois Country: The Mississippi Frontier in Colonial Times* (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2000) and Shenwen Li, *Stratégies missionnaires des Jésuites Français en Nouvelle-France et en Chine au XVIIIème siècle* (Saint-Nicolas (Québec): Les Presses de l'Université Laval; Paris: L'Harmattan, 2001).

France or pagans in China.²⁰ Deslandres draws powerful links between approaches adopted in the Metropole and those employed in extra-European settings, boldly claiming that missions to heretics, ignorant Catholics and new frontier peoples were ‘of the same essence and were undertaken in the same spirit.’²¹ This view of early modern missionaries seemingly rests on the understanding that pastoral work in both their old and new settings was framed in terms of one all-encompassing metaphor – the ‘vineyard of the lord.’ This unity of purpose and experience was promoted by the universal end-result of Catholic mission: salvation in Christ. And if we follow the argument, the ultimate similarity between various types of mission was able to unite the missionary efforts of distinct religious institutes. Jesuits, Capuchins, Franciscans, and Lazarists were therefore all engaged in working in what John O’Malley has termed the ‘pervasive metaphor’ which the ‘vineyard of the Lord’ represents.²²

In an effort to showcase greater diversity, recent groups of historians have come together in edited collections. A. G. Roeber and his colleagues provide a greater variety of interpretations of missionary activity in the early modern Americas in their study of exchanges between Native Americans and white settlers from the seventeenth to the nineteenth centuries. However, their volume is tightly focused on the Northeast and Great Lakes region, and most of the essays concentrate on engagements yielded from Moravian missionary records.²³ The geographical range embraced in the ensemble edited by Allen Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff allows for a broader view of religious culture in the regions under analysis, although the authors’ vantage points provide less information on missionary activity as a discrete exercise, concentrating instead on the experience of a wide range of actors in transferring European concepts of sainthood to colonial churches.²⁴ More sustained focus on the labours of Catholic missionaries comes in Owen White and J. P. Daughton’s joint volume, which examines a variety of locations to demonstrate the global impact of missionaries in the advancement of French Christian civilisation. Even so, the material is weighted towards ventures within one of

²⁰ Luke Clossey, *Salvation and globalization in the Early Jesuit Missions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

²¹ Deslandres, *Croire*, 79.

²² John W. O’Malley, *Saints or Devils Incarnate, Studies in Jesuit History* (Boston: Brill, 2013), 224.

²³ A. G. Roeber, *Ethnographies and Exchanges : Native Americans, Moravians, and Catholics in early North America* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2008).

²⁴ *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, eds. Allen Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff (New York: Routledge, 2003). See also *Empires of God: Religious Encounters in the Early Modern Atlantic*, ed. Linda Gregerson and Susan Juster (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011), which brings together literary and historical scholars to explore religious and political narratives of discovery and resettlement in the Atlantic world from a multi-denominational set of sources.

the two dominant missionary zones, in this case New France.²⁵ Moreover, the essays in their work are of interest principally to scholars of modern Catholic missionary experience, as most of the contributions cover nineteenth- and twentieth-century cases. The recent collection edited by Pierre-Antoine Fabre and Bernard Vincent shares a similar drawback, for while it answers an important need for comparative examination of the special demands that mission placed on religious vocations, training and experience, it relies heavily on the Jesuits and is confined to examples from the Iberian space.²⁶

Concerns about geographical and chronological limits aside, overall these studies do not tend to take into account the drawbacks of the unitary model. Indeed, they largely ignore the fact that early modern missionary Catholicism produced not one, but two models of church: on one hand the Tridentine model of precept and authority and on the other, a highly distinct missionary model of ministry and practice. The challenges and realities that faced early modern missionaries were not, as Ditchfield points out, ‘a mirror image of their normative Roman Catholic prototype.’²⁷ This is not to suggest that the formal relationships linking missionary jurisdictions and the central authorities of the Catholic church were split asunder in this period. Importantly, the decrees of the Council of Trent had promoted the authority of the traditional ecclesiastical hierarchy – above all its episcopate. Over time church authorities made efforts to implement this interpretation of government in territories outside Europe, for example, from the 1660s in New France, where missionaries had been directly subject to the papacy until 1659.²⁸ Likewise, the church’s primary tools of instruction (such as the Roman catechism) and structures for clerical formation were transferred to mission lands. Yet the Council had offered no specific wisdom when it came to the missionary church, whose structures and distance from the European centre fostered a sense of exemption and privilege, and encouraged autonomy from the Tridentine framework of command and ministry.

Scholars are now, however, becoming more likely to question the supposed commonalities of the Tridentine model and its missionary variants. In his comprehensive overview of the Jesuit mission to China, which ran from 1579 to 1724, Brockey posits that the establishment, development and sustainability of Catholic communities in China hinged on the

²⁵ *In God's empire: French missionaries and the modern world*, eds. Owen White and J. P. Daughton (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

²⁶ *Missions religieuses modernes, “Notre lieu est le monde”*, Collection de l’École française de Rome 376, eds. Pierre-Antoine Fabre and Bernard Vincent (Rome: École française de Rome, 2007).

²⁷ Simon Ditchfield, “De-centering the Catholic Reformation: papacy and peoples in the early modern world,” *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte*, 101 (2010), 201.

²⁸ Alison Forrester, *Fathers, Pastors and Kings: Visions of Episcopacy in Seventeenth-Century France* (Manchester 2004), 101.

adaptation of European models to existing Chinese structures. To be sure, the Jesuits arrived in China with methods and practices honed while training in their European colleges, but exposure to foreign landscapes demanded transformation. In just one area, Brockey demonstrates how the Jesuits adapted Christianity to specifically Chinese social impulses, especially the importance of family clans, leading to the development of unique pastoral networks and management structures.²⁹ Until the Chinese Rites and Terms controversy thoroughly upset the Chinese church's developing sense of autonomy, these adaptations represented positive structural developments. Moreover, as Clossey demonstrates, these shifts occurred alongside broader changes in worldwide church operations and management, as vast distances between missionary sites brought forth multiple horizontal connections for the communication of information, relics and finances, which were entirely unmediated by Rome.³⁰ Yet although these findings hew closely to the themes of change and evolution in missionary organisation, they reveal little about the impact these changes had on missionary sensibilities. Missionaries were often personally bruised by the brutal differences of the frontier church, particularly those demands inherent in building a local Christian community from scratch. In this respect, Steven E. Turley offers a perspective not often seen in publications dealing with the reality of early modern missionary Catholicism: the dichotomies at the heart of missionary experience. Highlighting the potential importance of the subject, Turley's examination of the Franciscan mission to New Spain in the sixteenth century unveils missionaries desperately burdened by the linguistic and educational demands of developing pastoral plans for an unknown populace, as well as troubled by the administrative and political headaches associated with operating a mission adjacent to troublesome colonial expeditions. Faced with the contradiction that emerged between the long-evolved *habitus* of their corporate life and their new activities, Turley's Franciscans came to conclude that their new mission was 'irreconcilable with Franciscan spirituality' as it had developed in Europe.³¹

II

The concept of frontiers, and its usefulness to historians, has long been the subject of significant interpretation. Perhaps the most famous uses of the term in a historical context began in 1893 with Frederick Turner's series of lectures and papers, unified in his extremely

²⁹ Liam Matthew Brockey, *Journey to the East : the Jesuit Mission to China 1579-1724* (London and Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2007), chs. 7-10.

³⁰ For recent works, see Clossey, *Salvation and Globalization*; Micah True, *Masters and Students. Jesuit Mission Ethnography in Seventeenth-Century France* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2015).

³¹ Steven E. Turley, *Franciscan Spirituality and Mission in New Spain, 1524-1599* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2014), 2-4.

influential work *The Frontier in American History*. Turner's original elaboration of the term frontier and frontier history spoke of a powerful phenomenon that consistently 'broke the bonds of custom, offered new experiences, [and] called out new institutions and activities' in frontier settlements. His assessment of the American frontier lands conjured up images of daring adventure, long-distance travel, expanding borders, as well as movement and flux in societies, organisations and individuals.³² Many historians of modern America have since engaged with Turner's classic conception of the frontier thesis, probing his contentions that the frontier lands were typically weakly controlled communities whose inhabitants evinced the typical traits of the frontiersmen: self-reliance, independence and creativity³³. In contrast, frontier history has not received the same degree of analytical depth among early modernists. Recent works, however, attest to the growing significance of frontiers (and their variants) in defining administrative, military and political jurisdictions in the early modern world.³⁴ Phil McCluskey's analysis of French territorial ambitions in Lorraine and Savoy during the reign of Louis XIV spotlights frontier zones as decisive sites for dynastic power struggles in the ever-changing map of early modern Europe. These were areas where aggression and occupation could be inspired by defensive strategies, and in which the crown governed by compromise with pre-existing political structures and power-holders. McCluskey's focus on local politics and crown policy also serves as an important reminder that the study of frontiers demands significant attention to shifting power relationships between the inhabitants of frontier zones and centres of control.³⁵ Steven Ellis and Raingard Eßer similarly underscore the importance of religious frontiers as Europe divided along confessional lines, especially in the wake of the treaties of Augsburg, and later, Westphalia – both of which manifested the right of territorial rulers to define the religion of their subjects. However, while their volume notes the function of frontiers as lines of distinction and separation, it helpfully explains that frontiers were rarely

³² Frederick Jackson Turner, *The Frontier in American History* (New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1921), 4, 22, 247-8, 258.

³³ A sample of post-Turnerian works include Walter Prescott Webb, *The Great Plains* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1959); G. Edward White, *The Eastern Establishment and the Western Experience: the West of Frederic Remington, Theodore Roosevelt and Owen Wister* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968); *Frederick Jackson Turner, Rereading Frederick Jackson Turner: "The Significance of the Frontier in American History" and Other Essays*, ed. John Mack Faragher (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998); John Mack Faragher and Robert V. Hine, *The American West: A New Interpretive History* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000).

³⁴ Unfortunately, two very recent studies appeared as this volume was going to press, which did not leave time to incorporate them into this discussion: *Empires and Encounters 1350–1750*, ed. Wolfgang Reinhard (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 2015), and Tamar Herzog, *Frontiers of Possession: Spain and Portugal in Europe and the Americas* (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 2015). The former contains an exhaustive review of the early modern world's shifting borders, while Herzog's study examines the Spanish and Portuguese empires as a unified imperial space.

³⁵ Philip McCluskey, *Absolute Monarchy on the Frontiers: Louis XIV's Military Occupations of Lorraine and Savoy* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013).

impenetrable walls of strict exclusion, and instead were ‘border zones’ that allowed for a high degree of cross-frontier mobility, communication, exchange and compromise.³⁶

For the Catholic church, the opportunities and problems posed by a variety of new frontiers quickly became apparent. At base, the concept of frontiers implies the erection of new fronts (Latin, *frons*) in territorial space, and in their barest form these boundaries import notions of sovereign jurisdiction (spiritual or secular) over physical territory. In the early modern era, the church extended its oversight towards polar edges of the globe, which meant that many regions of Catholic activity and affiliation were extremely distant from European centres of policymaking and control. Their physical displacement from these centres is closely related to another quality of the frontier zone: its instability. While the Catholic church attempted to overcome the notion of frontier by replicating the European model of church and absorbing the areas into a ‘global church’ through its vertical network of authority (with its pinnacle in Rome), frontier areas remained areas of experimentation and challenge, which manifested when missionaries attempted to apply ancient religious practices, such as the duty to sacrifice and mortify, to the new frontier environments. However, the strictly spiritual duties of mission zones often criss-crossed with the pressures placed on missionaries by secular powers and heaped additional burdens on them.³⁷

The time is ripe for a further nuanced consideration of the meaning of ‘missionary Catholicism’ and its evolving relationship with newly discovered cultures and political and ecclesiastical authorities in the ‘founding era’ of missionary Catholicism, a crucial stage in the denomination’s global evolution. Drawing on cutting-edge research, the essays in this volume challenge the unitary theory of mission by confronting the uncertainties that emerged in Catholic practice on the frontiers of mission. Moreover, by examining such diverse themes as the re-positioning of authority in a globalising church, the ideological rivalries that emerged between competing clerical companies, or the new cultural and gendered boundaries flowing

³⁶ *Frontier and Border Regions in Early Modern Europe* (Hanover: Wehrhahn, 2013), eds. Reingard Eßer and Stephen G. Ellis, esp. 11-12. Deeper expositions of this concept have been tackled by scholars working on the early modern American frontier: Richard White, *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1615-1815* (Cambridge: CUP, 1991); Eric Hinderaker, *Elusive Empires: Constructing Colonialism in the Ohio Valley, 1673-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).

³⁷ For a flavour of the challenges of global mission from various linguistic perspectives, see Charlotte de Castel-L’Etstoile, *Les ouvriers d’une vigne stérile. Les Jésuites et la conversion des Indiens du Brésil, 1580-1620* (Paris: Centre Culturel Calouste Gulbelkian, 2000); Antal Molnár, *Katolikus missziók a hódolt Magyarországon, I, 1572-1647* (Budapest: Balassi Kiadó, 2002); *Órdenes religiosas entre América y Asia. Ideas para una historia misionera de los espacios coloniales*, ed. Elisabetta Corsi (Mexico City: El Colegio de México, 2008); Ângela Barreto Xavier, *A Invenção de Goa. Poder Imperial e Conversões Culturais nos Séculos XVI e XVII* (Lisbon: Imprensa de Ciências Sociais, 2008); *La Chine des Ming et de Matteo Ricci (1552-1610), Le premier dialogue des savoirs avec l’Europe*, ed. Isabelle Landry-Deron (Paris: Editions du Cerf, 2013).

from heightened contact with non-European peoples, the authors unveil the complexities of *early modern Catholicism's two-church model*, especially the highly unfamiliar structures and mentalities common to unstable frontier environments. Moving beyond traditional narratives, this book anchors its arguments directly in missionary testimony and introduces the voices of previously hidden actors. It therefore incorporates important new findings on Jesuit missionary enterprises, but guards against reducing early modern Catholic missions to a history of the Jesuits. The reader will also find ventures conducted by the Franciscans, Lazarists, and Ursulines in an array of mission sites that represents the truly global reach of early modern missionary Catholicism. These fruits of new research on the Balkans, the Adriatic, the Holy Land, and the Indian Ocean therefore enable the essays to provide a balanced and broad investigation of missions in frontier areas.

Among the divisive debates stirred by the Protestant Reformation, one item of contention concerned the precise spiritual and corporeal dispositions necessary to obtain forgiveness of sin. Whereas prominent reformers such as Martin Luther professed free remission of sins and rejected the sacrament of penance, Catholics reconfirmed the importance of sacramental absolution and works of satisfaction to efface sin.³⁸ Traditional means of accomplishing this lay in fasting, prayer and alms, but more extreme forms of mortification became increasingly popular in the early modern era. One study of forty-two Jesuit biographies of the period, including those of Francis Xavier, Louis Gonzaga and Julien Maunoir, finds that ninety percent recorded practices of mortification among their subjects.³⁹ At first glance, the departure of thousands of missionaries from mainland Europe outwards did not alter the importance of bodily mortifications for Catholic clergy and religious – physical asceticism was a staple element of consecrated spirituality – but exactly how these practices would meld with new frontier conditions was an untested exercise. Moreover, the fact that missionaries practised austerities reveals little of their own feelings regarding the pressures to suffer and mortify on the mission field.

The investigations of Natalie Davis and Brad Gregory confirm that dying for the faith was a bedrock principle of post-Reformation Christianity.⁴⁰ With these findings in mind, in this volume Sean Smith takes up the closure of one of the least reported early missionary exercises, the Lazarist mission to Fort Dauphin in Madagascar, in the 1670s as sure evidence that

³⁸ Claudie Vanasse, *Les Saintes Cruautés. La mortification corporelle dans le catholicisme français moderne* (PhD diss., Université de Montréal, 2005), 28.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 336.

⁴⁰ Natalie Z. Davis, *Society and Culture in Early Modern France* (Stanford and London: Stanford University Press, 1975), ch. 6; Brad S. Gregory, *Salvation at Stake: Christian Martyrdom in early modern Europe* (Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 1999).

European standards of ecclesiastical austerity were ill-fitted for life and pastoral work in a frontier zone. Conceived as an accompaniment to a colonial party sponsored by the French Crown, two Lazarist missionaries were initially commissioned by Vincent de Paul to evangelise the Malagasy people. However, true to norms then prevailing among many missionary leaders and congregations, de Paul also encouraged his missionaries to suffer and possibly die for the faith in their efforts. Andrew Redden similarly reveals how Jesuit missionaries sent to the outer limits of the Spanish empire in Chile were imbued by their superiors with a love of suffering and a desire for martyrdom. Suffering and death were not novel to ecclesiastical settings, of course; in the third century, Tertullian memorably suggested that the ‘blood of the martyrs is the seed of the Church’, but the opening up of new missionary frontiers renewed the pressures on the era’s spiritual agents to make personal sacrifices for the greater glory of God.⁴¹

How did missionary sacrifices, sufferings and martyrdoms contribute to the building of frontier churches? Brockey reveals that news of the bloody persecutions of Jesuits in Japan during the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, combined with the heroic tales of great apostles such as Saint Francis Xavier, were successful in producing many missionary vocations, but despite a rich crop of missionary martyrs the Japanese mission ultimately ended in failure.⁴² The regular loss of vital human resources that were necessary for evangelisation buttresses the observation that Ronnie Po-chia Hsia makes in the essay that he has contributed to this volume: though many church insiders remained conflicted about the benefits of self-sacrifice, the missionary culture of desired martyrdom continued to thrive in the early modern period. His fellow contributors, Sean Smith and Andrew Redden, delve into factors that underpinned this drive to suffer and be martyred, contrasting them with the mental, pastoral and organizational obstacles to this goal that missionaries frequently identified. The often startlingly frank observations of missionaries revealed that they were not the death-obsessed automatons portrayed in hagiographies, and their pragmatism gleaned from a ‘participant perspective’ regularly counterbalanced the institutional pressures to die. Indeed, when it came to martyrdom, locations seen as frontiers of opportunity were often transformed into frontiers of doubt and resistance as missionaries tackled the inherited rhetoric of suffering.

Hsia also correctly identifies that the constant interplay between colonialism and globalising Catholicism was among the key influences on the missionary experience. Spanish interest in South America, for instance, enrolled missionaries in the brutal machinery of

⁴¹ T.H.Bindley, *The Apology of Tertullian for the Christians* (London and Oxford: Parker & Co.,1890), 143.

⁴² Brockey, *Journey to the East*, 227-228.

oppression, and what Diarmuid MacCulloch refers to as the new theology of mission devised for the colonies borrowed heavily from its methods of conquest.⁴³ In Central America, Dominican and Franciscan friars cooperated vigorously in removing vestiges of the pre-Christian order. Indeed, in many locations it was difficult to tell the difference between the violence of the soldier of empires and that of the *sacerdos* of Rome. Of his own volition, the Franciscan provincial in Yucatan set up a local inquisition to stamp out pre-Conquest religious rites through torture and interrogation.⁴⁴ In other places, missions bore the marks of the material objectives of secular colonial administration. The Jesuits of Martinique owned one of the biggest sugar factories dependent on slave labour in 1660, and the Dominicans of Guadeloupe were among the biggest slaveholders of that colony.⁴⁵ By the eighteenth century the size of the Jesuits' properties and endowments in Panama produced the waves of agitation that first led to their indictment for 'scandalous trading' and then eventually triggered their downfall in the Portuguese dominions.⁴⁶

That Catholic missionaries were often called to work with, execute or indeed borrow from the calculations of empire is uncontroverted in the historical record. Daughton and White's observation that missionaries 'were not simply carriers of a religious message' is therefore a mild truism, which their volume cements by measuring the influence missionaries exerted on French imperial projects.⁴⁷ However, while these efforts extend historical notice of the ways in which missionaries complicated or complemented empire-building, the precise point of convergence between secular ambitions and the religious vocation of missionaries remains less understood. Most particularly, how these alliances affected missionary morale is a question that has received short shrift. By analysing the complex relationship between the dual roles of apostles and peacemakers on the seventeenth-century Chilean frontier, Andrew Redden's case-study illustrates the tough choices imposed on missionary agents. Parachuted into a highly intense atmosphere of constant warring between Indian tribes and Spanish conquerors, Jesuits sent to this landscape quickly discovered that their dearly-held missionary vision was close to shattering. After the Jesuit missionaries were handed hefty responsibilities by the crown for sealing a peace deal between the battling sides, the effects of their involvement with the secular power became plain. Missionary strategy was the first item

⁴³ MacCulloch, *Reformation*, 428.

⁴⁴ Inga Clendinnen, *Ambivalent Conquests: Maya and Spaniard in Yucatan 1517-1570* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 40–41, 72-109.

⁴⁵ Philippe P. Boucher, *France and the American Tropics to 1700, Tropics of Discontent* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2008), 158, 230.

⁴⁶ Owen Chadwick, *The Popes and European Revolution* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981), 350.

⁴⁷ Daughton and White, *In God's Empire*, 6.

affected, borne out with an order for missionaries to travel with armed escorts in 1615. At first glance, this instruction constituted a sensible command in a tricky missionary scenario, yet Redden discloses that it collided not solely with biblical teachings on the sacrificial shepherd but also with the common aspirations of the wider Jesuit body. Moreover, when this strategy produced dire failings, the emotions of missionaries were next to take a hit.

Not so for the missionary perspective unveiled by Andrew McCormick, whose essay demonstrates the extent to which missionary sensibilities had evolved by the eighteenth century. Of course, as Ronnie Po-chia Hsia demonstrates in his essay, missionaries of the early modern period were often heavily involved as ‘instruments of diplomacy’ in the extension of missionary frontiers. France regularly enrolled its missionaries as royal ambassadors, as happened with the French Jesuits of the Chinese Vice-province in the seventeenth century. McCormick’s study explores the diplomatic uses of missionary organizations in another region, but comparison of his findings with those of Redden reveals a massive transition in missionary attitudes over time. For McCormick, the context for his investigation is the Lazarists’ mission to the Greek Archipelago in the late 1770s. By this time, the Society of Jesus, which had laboured in the Americas, Europe and Asia since the beginning of the exploratory period, had found itself universally suppressed in 1773. The mission to the islands was therefore opened in a post-Jesuit age, but the Lazarists as successors showed themselves to be just as adept in temporal matters as members of the much-maligned Society. Unlike Redden’s early seventeenth-century Jesuits, who were deeply concerned by collusion with the crown, the Lazarist missionary, Viguier, sent to the Archipelago was far less concerned with brokering peace between the two established powers in the region (the French crown and Propaganda Fide) and more focused on establishing France’s sole sovereign sway. Indeed, McCormick illustrates just how at ease a Catholic missionary could be with political affairs in this era. The agent sent by Lazarists for a tour of inspection spoke with the confidence of a French imperial officer, promoting the mission not as a free-standing effort to save souls, but as a vehicle to advance France’s strategic, financial and commercial interests in the Mediterranean. Moreover, even outwardly spiritual objectives – the setting up of a regional seminary – were plainly geared to side-lining the influence of Rome and cementing French language, culture and ultimately French political control over these outposts.

McCormick’s analysis of the organisational minutiae and machinations of missionary activities is a stark reminder that the Catholic church’s ‘vineyard’ was not an evenly managed pasture. Missionary stations were often positioned on multiple and criss-crossing boundaries of authority. Although the creation of Propaganda Fide was designed to establish universal and

uniform management of worldwide Catholic missions, frontier mission zones were difficult to organise and police effectively. In the first place, the papacy often lacked the resources necessary to bring missionary outlays into closer orbit, and therefore, control. The Archipelago mission conducted by Viguier in the eighteenth century exhibited the battles between the claims of central powers in the church and those of secular sovereigns, but established interests in the church, notably diocesan authorities and religious orders, further crowded the missionary arena. If it is axiomatic that Catholic missionaries shared basic understandings of their functions, Megan Armstrong's chapter magnifies the significant corporate differences, in ethos and priorities, reigning between Catholic missionary institutes and their members. Clerical competition was a fairly widespread phenomenon in an era when the drive for souls accelerated, but the potential for rivalry depended on several factors, especially questions of jurisdiction.

The papacy's partitioning of the world between Portugal and Spain was one way of eliminating competition among missionaries based on the perennially divisive factor of nationhood. Further, religious institutes of different stripes could be granted exclusive rights to named territories, and in the years after Propaganda's founding, this practise was not uncommon. This did not exclude, but greatly reduced the potential for clerical rivalry, yet Armstrong's analysis of a frontier at the very heart of Christendom discloses the competition between different branches of the same religious ethos. Her focus on the Observant Franciscans' Custody of the Holy Land in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries at first recognises its valuable status as a highly contested geopolitical frontier. After all, the annexation of Jerusalem by the ever-encroaching Ottomans in 1517 threatened the region's ancient Christian footholds. Buoyed by impulses at the heart of the Catholic reform, however, rival missionary incursions into the Custody of the Holy Land rapidly accentuated jurisdictional and ideological frontiers within this sensitive zone. While the expanding influence and supervision of Propaganda Fide is again evident in this chapter, competition between Capuchins and Observant Franciscans over sacred space in the Holy Land sheds more light on the forces of devolved ecclesiastical power. Indeed, Armstrong's conclusion that the legitimacy of possession in the Holy Land rested on competing visions of the inheritance of St Francis of Assis is a further reminder that jurisdictional questions in the early modern Catholic church were highly localised and often organization-specific.

Armstrong's analysis adeptly illustrates the capacity of early modern missionary actors to re-centre, and indeed de-centre, common sources of inspiration and authority within Catholicism. Battling internal divisions within their order, the Franciscans of the Holy Land did

not look to Rome or the decrees of Trent for soothing remedies. While the Roman dicastery sought to manage the *custos*, the Franciscans found greater comfort in drawing the links between their mission and the mission of Christ. Their dense pilgrimage literature, filled with the history of the Franciscans' lengthy presence in the region, conferred a unique type of ecclesial legitimacy. Like the Jesuits who developed horizontal links across their global missions, the Franciscans of the Holy Land discovered unitive sources in their regional history. Unmediated by centralising tendencies in the post-Tridentine church, this history was rooted in the special encounter of Francis and Christ in the Holy Land, and embedded in the local ecclesiastical structures and landscape. However, as Armstrong forcefully demonstrates, the Franciscans' efforts to re-centre their spiritual ethos and history were in danger of serious contestation by rivals and a meddling European power.

The power of localised Catholic structures comes into clear focus in the duelling between Jesuit and Franciscan missionaries labouring in the sixteenth and seventeenth-century Turkish Balkans. Tadhg Ó hAnnracháin's account of the frictions that emerged in frontier zones created by successive Ottoman encroachments begins by acknowledging that both spiritual and secular jurisdiction in the Balkans was often illusory at this time. Although sizable Catholic fronts remained in Bosnia, Hungary, Ragusa (present-day Dubrovnik) and Northern Albania, the onset of Turkish rule cut across the ancient claims of competing Christian monarchs, preventing the effective establishment of functioning hierarchical structures in these regions. With these limitations in mind, the missionary zones presented rich but challenging opportunities for Catholic actors working in areas with multiple linguistic, ethnic and religious identities, and Ó hAnnracháin's probe soon turns to examining missionary competition over these variegated communities. When, in 1612, the Jesuits launched two missions in territory that was home to powerful contingents of Franciscans, tensions between the two institutes yielded two completely different models of Catholic identity and practice. As Ó hAnnracháin demonstrates, the papacy - through Propaganda Fide's direct financial sponsorship of the mission - deployed Jesuits as ambassadors of reforming Catholicism in order to consolidate the region's existing Christian communities. However, if Rome could supply co-ordinated direction at the top, unity between missionaries on the ground was in short supply. Almost as soon as they arrived, clashes over access, privileges and moral behaviour pitted the sober clericalism of post-Tridentine Jesuits against the less inhibited and seemingly less orthodox approaches of the Franciscan frontiersmen.

Dominique Deslandres's presentation of the Ursuline mission in seventeenth-century Québec yields further evidence that Catholic frontiers were at the edges of orthodoxy. Her

focus on the career of Marie de l'Incarnation adds further stock to narratives of female ministry that remain all too forgotten in the history of mission. Of course, given the epoch's special emphasis on conversion, the qualitative distinctions between male and female missionaries often make studying female empowerment trickier. Unlike their male counterparts, whose missionary institutes often put a high premium on baptisms, women religious were unable to dispense sacraments and were largely excluded from initiating new believers, instead engaging in processes of 'conversions by caring' in their management of education, health and other pastoral services. The relative scarcity until recently of studies on female missionaries was perhaps another product of the unitary model of Catholicism and the traditional foregrounding of institutional history for this period. By focusing attention on vertical power structures and the activities of major (male) missionary institutes like the Society of Jesus, scholars underplayed the often subversive voices of women and other muted groups. This is not to say that significant advances have not been made. Since the seminal works of Natalie Zemon Davis and Lyndal Roper, authors such as Barbara Diefendorf evince the many possibilities open to female agency in an early modern context.⁴⁸ In her pathmarking work on the activities of Catholic women in the Parisian cityscape, Diefendorf stresses that women shed traditional restrictions to lead impressive fundraising campaigns, supervise construction projects and, ultimately, become leaders of religious change.⁴⁹ However, while these works of scholarship erect an important backdrop to religious activity abroad, the religious participation of women in early modern frontier zones remains worthy of far greater scrutiny.⁵⁰

The opening for Deslandres' essay is France's foundation of embryonic colonies on the Saint Lawrence river, where the crown charged a small group of nuns with instilling the Christian faith among indigenous women. By studying the nuns' pioneering schools for native women, Deslandres casts light on the heavily female-orientated strategies of both spiritual and secular authorities in this complex enterprise, for the nun's roles became central to the overarching objective to 'Frenchify' the potential wives of future colonists and thereby consolidate control over the newly conquered territory. In addition, her assessment of first-hand

⁴⁸ Lyndal Roper, *The Holy Household: Women and Morals in Reformation Augsburg* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989); Natalie Zemon Davis, *Society and Culture in Early Modern France* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1975), 65-96.

⁴⁹ Diefendorf, *From Penitence to Charity*. For additional perspectives see Susan E. Dinan, *Women and Poor Relief in Seventeenth-Century France: The Early History of the Daughters of Charity* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006) and Matthieu Bréjon de Lavergnée, *Histoire des Filles de la Charité, XVIIe–XVIIIe siècles: la rue pour cloître* (Paris: Fayard, 2011).

⁵⁰ For two relevant edited collections see *Women and Religion in Old and New Worlds*, eds. Susan E. Dinan and Debra Meyers (New York: Routledge, 2001) and *Women and Religion in the Atlantic Age, 1550-1900*, eds. Emily Clark and Mary Laven (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013).

testimony from Marie de l'Incarnation yields a clear picture of the nuns' struggles to reproduce traditional French familial structures among indigenous Amerindian women. By uncovering how Marie queried highly gendered socio-economic norms in the North American landscape, Deslandres is able to tease out her capacity (agency) to identify the frayed edges of imperial policies. Although recruited by the crown, the written critiques of this frontierswoman lay bare the kind of spirited independence and pragmatism that women could develop in the face of untested schemes that had been conceived in the metropole. As a key witness to indigenous resistance to European gender structures, above all the objections of native women, the nun eventually made a complete re-evaluation of colonial strategy. In the end, this produced a surprising recognition that Roman Catholicism transplanted to a highly gendered frontier was completely 'other.'

In common with many of the missionaries presented in this volume, the experience of the Québec nuns effectively underlines the local character and imprint of the early modern missionary experience of Catholicism. Indeed, the gender models which the Ursulines sought to impose were radically transformed by their reception in the social, political and religious context of the Canadian frontier. Using the theme of tears and weeping for her analysis, Karin Velez similarly explores how local actors across three discrete missionary situations appropriated and reinterpreted signs of authentic Catholic belief. The meanings assigned to tears by contemporary Jesuit missionaries were highly symbolic of the strengths and priorities of European Catholicism. Akin to the sign of the cross, Marian devotions such as the rosary, and other sacramentals endorsed by the Catholic hierarchy, tears and weeping testified to the intensity of belief among practitioners of the true faith. As Trevor Johnson points out, faced with intense confessional debates on the proper transmission of grace, the church promoted these rituals and objects as a way to 'expunge from memory' the iconoclasm of the Protestant reformers and mark the Counter-Reform's successes.⁵¹ Velez starts with this interpretation of tears as potent symbols of Catholic identity (and especially the sincerity of that identity), but she advances beyond the dominant narrative, unearthing alternative meanings to these emotional outpourings by the faithful. The records disclosed suggest that crying on the frontier was materially different from crying in more traditional settings, precisely because weeping was interpreted in distinct ways by actors on the frontier. According to Velez, frontier scenarios bring forth instances of tears that go far beyond the standard emblem of joyous conversion, denoting small shifts and bridges in Catholic practice and meaning.

⁵¹ Trevor Johnson, *Magistrates, Madonnas and Miracles: the Counter Reformation in the Upper Palatinate* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2009), 150, 236.

Velez's comparative investigation of these shifts in meaning fully encapsulates the methodological approach of the volume as a whole. Her inquiry into affective responses to conversion lifts the veil on the immense changes that globalisation wrought on Catholicism in the early modern period. Essentially arguing that seventeenth-century Catholicism actually consisted of variegated local instances of the faith, Velez's chapter confirms the binding thread of many of the volume's contributions: that the main shared characteristic of the early modern missionary cohort was in fact their heterogeneity and their variable responses to the unsettled certainties of the frontier zone. While missionaries of the early modern era were technically united in their mission of evangelization, their labours at the peripheries of Catholic space and culture in distinct regions of the world opened their eyes to the transformative effects of Catholicism's transference. Setting off with buoyant hopes of conversion and church-building, missionaries realised that doubt, disappointment, resistance and failure often merged with their apostolic ambitions in new territories. In the end, they came to conclude that the missionary church was heavens apart from the ecclesiastical system that they had left behind.

