



Provided by the author(s) and University of Galway in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite the published version when available.

Title	Translating the Vatican: Paul Cullen, power and language in nineteenth-century Ireland
Author(s)	O'Connor, Anne
Publication Date	2014-09-29
Publication Information	Anne O'Connor (2014) 'Translating the Vatican: Paul Cullen, power and language in nineteenth-century Ireland'. <i>Irish Studies Review</i> , 22 (4):450-465.
Publisher	Taylor & Francis
Link to publisher's version	http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09670882.2014.955324
Item record	http://hdl.handle.net/10379/5800
DOI	http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09670882.2014.955324

Downloaded 2024-05-11T17:17:15Z

Some rights reserved. For more information, please see the item record link above.



Cover Sheet

Article:

Translating the Vatican: Paul Cullen, power and language in nineteenth-century Ireland

Dr. Anne O'Connor
School of Languages, Literatures and Cultures
NUI Galway
Galway
Ireland

Biographical Details:

Dr. Anne O'Connor is a lecturer in Italian Studies in the School of Languages, Literatures and Cultures in NUI Galway. A graduate of University College Cork, Johns Hopkins University and the University of Birmingham, she specialises in nineteenth-century European literature, history and translation. She is the author of *Florence: City and Memory in the Nineteenth Century* (Città di Vita, 2008) and Italian editor and translator of *European Romanticism: A Reader* (Continuum, 2010). She has recently edited *Nation/Nazione: Irish Nationalism and the Italian Risorgimento* (UCD Press, 2013). She is currently translating the Italian correspondence of Cardinal Paul Cullen for the Irish Manuscripts Commission and has recently received a research grant from the Irish Research Council for a project on translation in nineteenth-century Ireland.

Abstract

This paper examines how one of the most influential figures in nineteenth-century Ireland, Cardinal Paul Cullen, used language and translation to further his career and his vision for the Catholic Church in this period. It shows how Cullen's language skills served him throughout his life in his role as an agent and liaison, a linking figure between different worlds. The paper demonstrates how Cullen's linguistic abilities and translations gave an early jump start to his career and subsequently expanded his sphere of influence from the confines of the Vatican to the vast expanses of the Catholic English-speaking world. Through language, Cullen positioned himself as a vital conduit for Irish-Vatican relations and came to be the dominant force in Irish Catholicism for almost thirty years, connecting Ireland to Rome and translating his ambitions and those of Vatican into reality in Ireland. The paper will demonstrate how language was a forceful tool for change and an instrument of power when wielded by Cullen.

Translating the Vatican:

Paul Cullen, power and language in nineteenth-century Ireland

The position and dominance of Paul Cullen (1803-1878) in nineteenth-century Irish history has been well documented: the man who was Archbishop of Armagh, then Archbishop of Dublin and Ireland's first cardinal, exerted an influence over Ireland that ranged from the religious to the social, the educational to the political spheres making him one of the most important figures of the era.¹ On his death in 1878 the *Times* said that for twenty-six years 'No man in the kingdom has exercised a greater personal influence, or wielded more absolute power'². One aspect of his dominance and influence which has never been adequately acknowledged or systematically examined is the extent to which Paul Cullen's language skills contributed to his career in the church and furthermore, how he used his linguistic abilities to shape the church in Ireland. Desmond Bowen points to many factors in Cullen's effectiveness in radically changing the church in Ireland: his spiritual zeal, his fixity of aim, his reasonable health and relatively long life.³ Like some other Cullen scholars, however, he does not mention the role that language played in Cullen's successful career. This paper will show how important it was in the nineteenth century to be proficient in Italian and how Cullen used this proficiency to his advantage. It will also highlight the importance of viewing Cullen's translations for the Vatican not just as a linguistic exercise but rather as a cultural mediation in which language was a powerful tool for change.

Early years in Rome

Paul Cullen, later Cardinal Cullen, was sent to Rome for training in November 1820 when he was 17 years of age – this move dramatically altered the fortunes of the Kildare-born man and set him on a career trajectory which was very different to his colleagues who stayed in Ireland. The young student was immediately immersed into a multilingual environment: in one of his first letters home to Ireland he says to his father that 'one would be led to imagine that he was in the town of Babylon and not in a Roman College'.⁴ He reports on an annual event held in the Urban College called the 'academy of languages' in which every student delivered a few verses in his own language – in 1821 there were no fewer than 20 languages at this event. During his first year in Rome, Cullen dedicated most of his time to the study of languages, initially Italian and then Hebrew and Greek. His uncle reported that even after just 5 months in Rome he had acquired a fair share of Italian⁵ and by July he said that '[Paul] will be master of over eight languages before he returns [to Ireland], for he has got an excellent memory to retain what he reads'.⁶ Cullen quickly realised the importance of applying himself to learning Italian because without it, he said to his father, 'it would be impossible here to study or be instructed in anything else'.⁷ He appears to have been a very motivated student and even during his holidays in 1822

decided to learn French so that he could converse in it with his uncle (Fr. James Maher) who had spent time in Paris.⁸

Cullen's study and eventual mastery of both modern and classical languages was hugely important to his subsequent fortunes: in October 1826 he received first prize in his class and gold medals in Hebrew, Greek, Dogmatic and Moral Theology and his awards were presented by Pope Leo XII.⁹ The Pope also conferred on Cullen 'a great and distinguished honour' by attending the public defence of his thesis at the end of his studies in 1828: Cullen proudly told his father that 'few Italians, less of any other nation, can boast of the Pope's presence on such an occasion; I believe no other Irishman was ever honoured in this way.'¹⁰ Two future popes, Gregory XVI and Leo XIII, were also present for the thesis defence that day. This thesis discussion would have been conducted entirely in Italian and would have been a lengthy discussion on detailed elements of theology. The man from Prospect, Co. Kildare obviously had a gift for languages and study and this shone through in his academic achievements during his time at the Urban College in Rome. Upon graduation he was rewarded for his efforts and skills by being named professor of Hebrew and Oriental languages at the College of the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide. Propaganda Fide was responsible for the formation of clerics and also the governance, promotion and co-ordination of the Catholic Church in non-Catholic countries (including Ireland).¹¹ By studying and then working at Propaganda's Urban College, Cullen was immersed in a polyglot world and came into contact with many important figures throughout the Catholic world. It was here, for example, that he first met Nicholas Wiseman, John Henry Newman, Angelo Mai and Mauro Cappellari, amongst others.

Cappellari in particular was to have a central role in promoting Cullen's career: at the time of his graduation, Cappellari was the Prefect of Propaganda Fide and in 1831 he became Pope Gregory XVI. As Christopher Korten has noted, 'While Cappellari had been drawn to men gifted intellectually, it was those with linguistic inclinations who were particularly sought out.'¹² Cullen was mentored and supported by Cappellari who valued his language skills and used him on various projects in Propaganda Fide. Korten has also observed that it was not just his skill in classical languages that Cappellari found useful; Cullen's modern languages were just as valuable. His excellent Italian meant that Cullen could translate or explain important English documents to his superiors in Propaganda Fide.¹³ It was a function he was to continue throughout his life. Translation is a linking task where the translator moves between two worlds through the medium of language. In recent years, the notion of the invisible translator has been widely discussed¹⁴; for Cullen in the nineteenth century, however, his translation activity in Rome had the opposite effect and made him a more visible and therefore a more important and valued colleague. His early translation tasks at Propaganda meant that he became an important intermediary, a conduit for information and a liaison between many different worlds that converged in Rome in the nineteenth century.

At Propaganda Fide, Cullen not only worked as a Professor of Languages and Scripture, he was also in charge of the Printing Press and Library in that institution.¹⁵ As such, his role in printing, buying and selling books, dictionaries and translations, placed him at the centre of the book trade and the circulation of knowledge in ecclesiastical Rome at the time. As a hub of a polyglot world, Propaganda's printing needs were many and varied. During his time in this role, Cullen published an edition of the Greek and Latin lexicon of Hedericus and also edited the *Acta* of the Congregation of Propaganda.¹⁶ In the context of this paper, an interesting element in Cullen's activities in Rome was his work on a Hebrew translation of the Bible. This project, which was conducted under the auspices of the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide, meant that Cullen collaborated with important ecclesiastical figures such as Angelo Mai, Michele Domenico Zecchinelli, Nicholas Wiseman and D. Francesco Finucci.¹⁷ He was in correspondence with them on practical and technical matters relating to the Bible: in Cullen's papers in the archive of the Irish College in Rome, there is a draft outlining the opinions of Mai, Zecchinelli, Wiseman and Finucci on the proposed new Hebrew Bible. Cullen was proud of his involvement in this project and told his uncle that for the new Hebrew Bible, part of its correction had been given to him and that it would not be easy to 'find one to substitute in my place.'¹⁸ Translation on such a large and ambitious scale would have tested the linguistic abilities of all involved and honed their appreciation of the intricacies of language and transference between cultures. Since the time of St. Jerome, the history of translation has been intimately connected with the history of the Bible and, in participating in a translation of the Bible, Cullen was joining a long line of scholarly activity which sought to use language to further a religious cause.¹⁹ During his time in Rome, the Irishman became sensitive to the issues in translating from one language to another. In a note on translation contained in his early papers, he wrote:

In determining the signification of a word we cannot place too much reliance on the meaning which a similar word may have in another language, although in some respects there may exist an affinity, or analogy between the two languages. This may be proved by the fact that to many expressions, some languages though intimately in some regards connected, assign different, nay, completely opposite significations.²⁰

Describing what is now termed as equivalence, Cullen here demonstrates how translation is not an automatic process but instead requires thought and prior knowledge.

Cullen's exposure during his time in Rome to notable linguists and his ability to function and thrive in a multilingual environment, gave him an appreciation for the value of language skills and also the importance of precision in language. Cullen worked with important figures such Giuseppe Mezzofanti, Custodian-in-Chief of the Vatican Library, and a member of the Propaganda Fide who, according to his biographer (the Irishman Charles Russell), spoke thirty-eight languages perfectly.²¹ Mezzofanti was a director of studies at Propaganda Fide and as such would have been influential in the educational formation of students at the time. The elevation from humble origins in Bologna

of this noted linguist and translator to positions of authority in Rome and to the honour of Cardinal, point to the value placed on linguistic skills in the Vatican at this time. Mezzofanti was a guest of the Pope once a week and was promoted to Cardinal for his skill in languages.²² He was part of Cullen's Roman circle and along with other important figures in Rome at this time ranging from Mauro Cappellari to Angelo Mai provided important mentoring to Cullen in his multilingual ventures. Cullen certainly held Mezzofanti in high esteem; on one occasion, as Russell recounts, when Mezzofanti visited Propaganda, he knelt in the sacristy without making himself known but,

He was at length recognised by Dr. Cullen, the present archbishop of Dublin, (at that time professor of Scripture in the Propaganda,) who at once procured for the distinguished stranger the attention which he justly deserved in such an institution.²³

When subsequently defending the Pope's support for literature and art, Cullen named the achievements of Angelo Mai and Giuseppe Mezzofanti as key figures in the Papacy's enlightened approach.²⁴

Cullen's time in Rome coincided with the rise in importance of the Catholic Church in the English-speaking world and Christopher Korten has argued that 'Numerical growth in the English-speaking Church would seem to suggest a concomitant rise in the value of the English language itself within the Church'.²⁵ As the English-speaking church grew in size and significance in the nineteenth century, Cullen and other key English speakers in Rome also became more important. The development of the missionary apparatus in English-speaking colonies such as Australia and Canada gave rise to a greater need in Rome for people who could translate from English and enable communication with these lands. Powerful individuals such as Nicholas Wiseman (also a talented linguist) and Cullen brought to the fore the needs of the English-speaking world and highlighted the importance of communication with the Catholic community in these lands. As Colin Barr has noted there were few English speakers in Rome and Propaganda needed someone not just to translate documents for them but also to explain issues to busy officials.²⁶ Cullen was not just important because he was an English speaker based in Rome, but also because of the key role that Irish clerics played in America, Australia and also in most of the colonies of the British Empire.²⁷ As a greater dialogue opened up between these areas and the Vatican in the nineteenth century, Cullen became a central figure in influencing appointments and determining the type of Catholicism in the English-speaking world. His success in Rome was partly a product of the rise in importance of English during this time and Cullen subsequently ensured that on the crest of this wave, he would be an influential intermediary between the Vatican and English-speaking world throughout his career.

Rector of the Irish College

Cullen was appointed rector of the Irish College in Rome in 1832 and in this role, he became both a translator and intermediary for the Irish clergy and hierarchy. Cullen would

receive petitions from Ireland and would translate these or verbally communicate them during a Papal Audience. As the Roman agent for the Irish bishops, the requests from Ireland placed Cullen in a powerful position where he could have a foot in both camps.²⁸ Korten has noted that the Irish, Scottish and English rectors of their respective colleges in Rome became 'both the unofficial agents in Rome for national affairs, conduits of communication between local clergy and the Roman hierarchy, and key papal advisors in these same geographical areas.'²⁹ This was most certainly true for Cullen in his time as rector of the Irish College as he was kept busy dealing with requests and appeals, many of which required his language skills. Knowledge of Italian was essential in dealing with practical and financial matters relating to running a college in Rome: tasks included the general management of the College, its farm, the students and the summer villa in Tivoli. Cullen's tight control over finances required constant interaction with Italians over payments and services. There had been tensions in the eighteenth century relating to the nationality of the rectors of the Irish, Scottish and English colleges as students and Propaganda disagreed over whether national or Italian rectors should be in place. Language was an element of this debate as some students wished to practice their English in the college, while Propaganda felt that it was essential to have Italian speakers in charge.³⁰ Cullen was an ideal person for rector of the Irish College as he possessed both the English skills to deal with the students and the Italian skills to insert them into a Roman world.

The rector of the Irish College in the nineteenth century thus became a liaison, working between Ireland and Rome, between English and Italian, enabling the flow of communication between the two.³¹ Information came through Cullen from Ireland for example, in 1849 he wrote to Cardinal Fransoni saying:

I am enclosing for Your Eminence the translation of the content of a letter I received some time ago from the Bishop of Clonfert. [...] This prelate speaks in the most flattering of terms of Mr. O Hanlon, one of the candidates for the primatial see of Ireland and says he has known him for twenty years.³²

The next month he sent Fransoni a letter saying that the Bishop of Meath had asked him to translate and send a letter to Propaganda.³³ A translator always has a power of choice and selection – words and tones can affect register – Cullen was this crucial intermediary who moved between two worlds, increasing his influence in both with his linguistic skills. The active intervention of Cullen in translation is seen in the diary of John Thomas Hynes, (future Bishop of Leros and later Vicar Apostolic of British Guiana) who recounts of interactions with Cullen in July 1843:

1st. July 1843. A newspaper from Demerara containing an advertisement of a meeting to be held in the Catholic church, and an announcement that two priests, MacNamara and MacDonald, were to be sent to Rome to represent the degraded state of that Vicariate to the Holy See. Shewed this paper to D^r. Cullen and D^r. Kirby -

Cullen offered to translate the articles immediately and lay them before Cardinal Fransoni.

16th. July 1843. Saw D^r. Cullen and gave him Taggart's letter to read, which seemed to make a great impression on him. He offered to translate the address and lay it before the Prefect of Propaganda.³⁴

Much of Cullen's time as rector of the Irish College was taken up with such tasks, working as a go-between for Ireland and the Vatican, for Irish priests and their superiors and for the emerging apparatus of the missionary church. Cullen's stay in Rome ended when he was appointed Archbishop of Armagh and thus returned to Ireland; he had proved his use to Propaganda in Rome, now he was to prove it again in Ireland.

Return to Ireland

When Cullen returned to Ireland in 1849, after nearly thirty years in Rome, he brought with him not just his language skills but also an appreciation for the way these skills could serve his career. He was appointed Archbishop of Armagh and in this role, he immediately continued his work as an intermediary, once again facilitating communication between the clergy and hierarchy and the Vatican, translating requests and letters to be sent to the Propaganda. Cullen was also appointed as apostolic delegate in Ireland, further underlining his function as a liaison between Ireland and Rome. Although at this stage Cullen was just one of four archbishops and not in any formal way superior to the other archbishops, he very quickly came to assume a position of power in the Irish church. One of the reasons for this ascendance was the close relationship that he maintained with the Vatican throughout his next 28 years in Ireland. In 1852 Cullen was appointed Archbishop of Dublin and remained in that position until his death in Dublin in 1878.

Cullen wrote a letter to Italy on an almost weekly basis during these 28 years, updating Rome on events in Ireland, sending requests, responding to queries and keeping his presence felt in the Vatican. He mainly wrote to his superiors in Propaganda Fide and to the rector of the Irish College in Rome. The Italian in the letters is almost flawless and although it is not the work of a native speaker, the vocabulary, syntax and grammar are all exemplary. The correspondence with Propaganda was central to Cullen's consolidation of his power in Ireland as it was the means by which he influenced ecclesiastical appointments in the country (and also throughout the world). Furthermore, by constantly putting forward his version of events and making recommendations to Propaganda on the church in Ireland, he was able to determine the direction of Vatican attitudes and policies on Ireland. This correspondence was always in Italian, to friends and mentors he had made during his time in Italy such as Cardinals Giacomo Filippo Fransoni and Alessandro Barnabò (Secretary Prefects of Propaganda). Larkin argues that this vast correspondence was 'real witness, if not a monument, to [Cullen's] deep need for Rome's reassurance and authority'.³⁵ More

importantly it was the means through which Cullen moulded the church in Ireland in the manner he saw fit.

As part of this correspondence, Cullen continued to offer himself as an intermediary, as he had done during his time in Rome, translating and passing on letters and information from Ireland to the Vatican. It was not just the clergy in Ireland who used Cullen as an intermediary, he often forwarded requests and information from the many Irish priests working in all parts of the world. For example:

I am taking the liberty of enclosing for Your Most Reverend Eminence a copy of a letter written to me by Monsignor Monahan, Bishop of Dominica, concerning the condition of the diocese of Trinidad. The letter, if Your Eminence has it translated, could help to shed some light on the choice of a new Archbishop for that vacancy.³⁶

As the years passed and Cullen's workload became more onerous, he generally sent documents and letters to be translated to Tobias Kirby, his successor as the rector of the Irish College in Rome rather than doing the translations himself. A letter detailing the death of Monsignor Smith, Archbishop of Trinidad and setting out the advantages of an Irish successor for Smith was sent to Kirby with the instructions: 'Please translate the letter and present it to His Eminence the Cardinal Prefect with my deepest respects'.³⁷ Such requests/demands were also sent to Cullen's friend Bernard Smith, vice rector of the Irish College, who was also involved in Cullen's translinguistic ventures in the early 1850s.³⁸ Cullen's use of Kirby to translate is rather blunt and he generally uses the imperative tense, telling him to translate documents himself or telling him to have them translated:

Vi ho mandato l'altro giorno il discorso del Rettore dell'Università Cattolica. Fatelo tradurre in italiano.³⁹ [The other day I sent you the speech by the rector of the Catholic University. Have it translated into Italian]

Other requests to Kirby for translation were more specific and self-serving. In 1851 Cullen sent a copy of his pastoral letter and asked his successor to have it translated into Italian for the Neapolitan newspaper *La Fede e la Scienza*.⁴⁰ Cullen appreciated the importance of maintaining his profile in both the English-speaking and the Italian-speaking world and translation was a tool which would facilitate such efforts. This personal propaganda was enhanced by Cullen's linguistic skills which enabled him to regularly show his superiors (in their own language) the work that he was doing in Ireland.⁴¹ When the pope's temporal possessions were threatened in 1859 and 1860 during the Italian Risorgimento, Cullen sent his pro-papal speeches to Rome, telling Kirby that they should be translated, circulated and read by the students of the Irish College.⁴²

Cullen's precision in linguistic matters is such that when he sent items that were not translated he told those at Propaganda who could do the translation. When he attached an article from the *Connacht Patriot*, he said that Monsignor Rinaldini would be able to

translate it into Italian.⁴³ Cullen obviously did not want to leave any element to chance and by naming the translator, he was both easing and influencing the linguistic transfer in Rome.⁴⁴ At other times, he tells Propaganda that rather sending a letter to Propaganda, he has sent it first to Kirby so that he can translate it.⁴⁵ A strong indicator of the value placed by Cullen on language was that he often wrote in Italian to Tobias Kirby even though both men were native English speakers. One may well question his motives in doing this when in his everyday life in Armagh and then Dublin he was surrounded by English. Certainly it is clear that Cullen felt perfectly at ease writing in the Italian language, his proficiency and fluency were excellent and it is probable that he wished to keep his language skills up to date.⁴⁶ He not only wrote to Kirby in Italian but also to another Irishman in Rome, Bernard Smith. Some of these letters to Kirby were written partly in Italian and partly in English – in these cases the Italian sections can be viewed as semi- public policy statements which could be circulated by Kirby in Rome on Cullen's behalf.

A practical consideration in writing in Italian and not in English to Kirby and Smith was that Cullen's letters were regularly opened and read en route. In 1851 he wrote to Kirby:

A friend of mine informed me today that my letters are being read in the post office in London. It matters little to me, because I do not write anything other than what I would like to see in the public newspapers. However, it will be no harm that you know it as well, because then you will be able to write more elegantly in order to adapt to London's style. [...] I will write another time in Hebrew in order to see if the interpreters are good.⁴⁷

In the 1860s when Cullen was involved in the (illegal) recruitment of soldiers for the Irish Papal Brigade, correspondence was a particularly sensitive issue and the Archbishop believed that his letters to the Vatican was being regularly opened.⁴⁸ By writing in a language other than English, Cullen could at least place a further obstacle in the path of those who wished to read what he was writing. Although at times he wrote to Kirby in English, when dealing with sensitive issues such as the Irish Brigade, Cullen always used Italian.

It is clear that Cullen valued linguistic precision and was aware of the varying qualities of translations; for example, he wrote critically of any poor translations such as the following: 'The letter in the *Univers* was badly translated. Today's *Tablet* gives the original, which is rather better.'⁴⁹ He writes of printing 'una traduzione accurata' [a precise translation] of an encyclical and the Syllabus.⁵⁰ Finally, in a letter to Propaganda, where he had given the substance of resolutions made by bishops (but not a word for word transcription), he now sends the original English document and asks that Monsignor Rinaldini, whose ability in English he obviously trusts, check that his previous translation is correct.⁵¹ In this case, Cullen is willing to place precision over pride and is happy to be corrected in order to ensure accuracy. As with most requests from Cullen, the matter is

multi-layered and the request for Rinaldini to check the translation could also be viewed as an attempt to obtain his support on the matter at hand.

For his part in Ireland, Cullen used his language skills to diffuse and propagate information from Rome. He happily and regularly tells his superiors that he has translated (or had translated) documents from Rome so as to facilitate their diffusion:

I had the honour of receiving some copies of the wonderful encyclical by the Holy Father, in which he discusses the celebration of the Mass on abrogated feasts, and I have already sent some copies of it to my suffragans. I will later have it translated into English so that everybody can read it more easily, and I am convinced that the reading of such a precious document will do much good.⁵²

I have had the recent magnificent address by the Holy Father translated into English and printed in English and Latin. It was read yesterday at mass in all of the churches in this diocese and produced an excellent effect on the people.⁵³

The requests for translation, the facilitation of such translations and the involvement in the multi-lingual ventures were all part of Cullen's circulation and diffusion of knowledge. He was a privileged intermediary, working between Italian and English selecting and expanding information when desired. His inner circle of helpers, Tobias Kirby, Laurence Forde and Patrick Francis Moran in particular, were not just loyal assistants, they were also trusted translators and linguists, a key skill in Cullen's ultramontane project. These men worked with Cullen, helping with his constant correspondence with the Vatican and enabling a steady flow of multilingual communication. The case of Cullen's nephew Patrick Moran is particularly instructive as Cullen was very involved in shaping his formation in Rome and subsequent career. Moran was sent to Rome at the even earlier age of 15 and mastered both Latin and Italian along with other modern and ancient languages. He mirrored Cullen's career in Rome, showing an aptitude for languages: in 1857 Moran was appointed professor of Hebrew in the Propaganda College, where he also taught Scripture. In his time in Rome, like his uncle, he was involved in tasks where he functioned as an intermediary translating, writing memoranda, drafting reports and advising on Irish and missionary affairs. In 1866 he returned to Ireland and worked as Cullen's private secretary. He was appointed professor of Hebrew and Scripture at Holy Cross College, Clonliffe, and to the staff of Catholic University of Ireland as professor of Scripture and scriptural languages and of Irish history. Moran was very close to Cullen and his language skills helped his uncle maintain his transnational enterprises.

The archbishop of Dublin also remained very close to clerics who had trained in Rome: John McCann, one of founders of Vincentians in Ireland, for example and Bernard Smith were close collaborators with Cullen.⁵⁴ All of these men were able to work in multilingual environments and importantly, their training in Rome ensured that they shared much common ground with the prelate. Bernard Smith, for example spent time as vice

rector of the Irish College in Rome; was professor of theology and Hebrew at Propaganda, a consultor to the congregations of Propaganda, and agent at Rome for the Benedictine communities in England and Australia.⁵⁵ The archbishop of Dublin actively collaborated with such men whose careers in many aspects mirrored his own. In his time at the helm of the Irish Church, Cullen ensured greater centralisation of power in that church, and importantly, greater influence of Rome. In this endeavour he worked closely with men who had a similar Italian formation to his own. Larkin has argued that 'The augmentation of Roman power and influence in the Irish Church was largely the result of the papal government's channelling its ecclesiastical patronage, especially in regard to Episcopal appointments, through Cullen, who was thereby enabled over time to create a like-minded and Roman-oriented hierarchy.'⁵⁶ The constant stream of communication with Rome, and the close collaboration with acquaintances from Roman times, ensured that Cullen's ultramontane project was actively facilitated and enhanced, his language skills were the conduit through which that communication took place.

An interesting point of contrast to Cullen's linguistic activities is the use of language of his equally gifted contemporary, the Archbishop of Tuam John MacHale. The Archbishop was a native Irish speaker and a dedicated translator between Irish, English and Latin.⁵⁷ Among his publications were translations of Moore's *Melodies*, sections of the Bible and the *Iliad* into Irish. He also published catechisms and devotional works in Irish.⁵⁸ His prodigious output and ability in Irish, English and Latin attest to his considerable linguistic skills. However, his languages never served him as well in Rome as did Cullen's and this is most starkly illustrated in his letters to Propaganda. MacHale was educated exclusively in Ireland and as such was trained in Latin, not Italian. In all his correspondence to Propaganda, often writing at the same time and on the same topic as Cullen, MacHale always wrote in Latin. Latin was of course the language of the Church and all understood it but Italian was the language of communication. Cullen could equally have written in Latin to Rome but he never did, not even to the Pope as he knew that Italian opened more doors and lent itself to greater immediacy. MacHale's use of Latin demonstrates his distance from Rome both linguistically and metaphorically and it is no coincidence that in the many disagreements between Cullen and MacHale, when recourse was made to Rome, Cullen regularly emerged the victor. He was able to outmanoeuvre his rival through his knowledge of the mechanisms in Rome and his use of language is one of the starkest examples of this inherent understanding that Cullen possessed. He constantly used it to his advantage, translating his knowledge of the Vatican into a powerful weapon in his armoury in his decades-long battles with MacHale.⁵⁹ J.J. Lee has referred to Cullen's 'feline sensitivity for the levers of power in the Vatican'⁶⁰ and it can be argued that the prelate's language skills enhanced this sensitivity and made him an even more effective operator in the complex intercultural and international world of church relations. The move from foreign to Irish education of the Irish clergy from the 1790s most certainly altered the linguistic abilities of the Irish clergy, thus limiting their ability to function in the multilingual but ultimately Italian-oriented hub of Roman Catholicism. Irish

bishops and priests who did not possess the linguistic skills necessary to correspond with Rome had to go through intermediaries such as Cullen in order to put their points across. This reduced the directness of their contact with Rome and also left them at the mercy of the translator and intermediary.

Maynooth and the training of priests

Throughout his time as prelate in Ireland, Cullen fought many battles over the direction of the Catholic Seminary at Maynooth. This divide between Cullen and Maynooth can also be seen in linguistic terms: Cullen was trained in Rome and used Italian on a regular basis; in Maynooth, Irish and French were the modern languages taught and an Italian professor of Canon Law, Salvatore Luzio, was only appointed at the end of the nineteenth century. Maynooth. The French influence on Maynooth, especially in its early years was significant, and the college was regularly the subject of accusations of Gallicanism, particularly from Cullen on his return from Rome.⁶¹ The lack of emphasis on Italian in Maynooth reflected the remove that the institution felt from Rome in contrast to the ultramontane tendencies of Cullen and the Holy Cross Seminary at Clonliffe, Dublin. The choice of language skills and language tuition certainly distanced Maynooth from Rome and isolated priests who had not acquired Italian from the central hub of decision making in the Vatican.

Prior to the foundation of Maynooth in 1795, Irish priests had travelled abroad for training but for the nineteenth century, like Archbishop MacHale, priests were able to train exclusively in Ireland.⁶² Cullen lamented the lack of language skills amongst Irish priests commenting in 1851 that 'It is not easy to find a priest here [in Ireland] who speaks Italian and has the other gifts.'⁶³ When possible, Cullen sent promising young men to Rome for training in the Irish College and not to Maynooth. On occasion he even dictated the language skills that such students were to acquire stating that they needed to be able to teach Greek, Latin and Italian in the seminary on their return to Ireland.⁶⁴ As a previous rector of the Irish College in Rome, Cullen had been responsible for the formation of students and during an absence from the College in 1840, students wrote to him saying that they were studying hard and 'in recreation we all speak Italian'.⁶⁵ The students were aware of Cullen's interest in language proficiency and it is pointed that they chose to highlight their use of Italian when bringing their diligence to the attention of the rector. Classes in the Urban College of Propaganda in Rome were held in Italian and thesis defences were most frequently held in Italian regardless of the student's origin⁶⁶ and therefore it was in the students' interest to gain a fast and competent knowledge of the language. A former student of the College recounts that at breakfast students were required in turn to recite a portion of the Gospels in Italian, and to give the English translation.⁶⁷ Cullen was involved in arranging language tuition for students and in ensuring that they would be able to function in the multilingual environment of the Vatican.⁶⁸

Cullen wished to educate young Irish clergymen to become proficient in languages so that they could be productively employed in his ultramontane enterprise in Ireland. Such

was the fate for example of Giacomo (James) Hynes, a previous student of the Irish College in Rome who was subsequently employed in the teaching of Latin and Italian in a small Carmelite College in Dublin.⁶⁹ It is obvious that Cullen valued language skills and when discussing various clergy, he often refers to their linguistic abilities. For example, in relation Fr. Giovanni (John) Ryan, who studied in the Irish College in Rome, Cullen said that he was an excellent preacher and theologian but that also he was proficient in Latin, Greek, Italian and French and had translated some pious works from Latin and Italian into English.⁷⁰ Other religious are discussed by Cullen in his letters and their linguistic abilities add to his praises of them.⁷¹

Cullen paid close attention to the teaching of Italian in Ireland and followed the case of Basilio Angeli with interest. Angeli was an Italian who came to Ireland and initially worked as a figurine-maker, and sold plaster figures. He subsequently became an Italian teacher and was later made professor or master of Italian language in Trinity College Dublin. Cullen observed with disgust that Angeli had become a Protestant in order to secure the job and was quite interested when some professors sought to have him removed from his post for being incapable and ignorant. A public trial was held, and Cullen observed, the 'witnesses who were examined in Angeli's favour were a certain Ferretti, editor of *Savonarola's Echo*, an Italian Protestant newspaper, and other friends of Fr. Gavazzi and Fr. Achilli. From this brotherhood, you will be easily able to conclude that Angeli does not deserve either sympathy or protection.'⁷² Cullen's interest in Angeli's fortunes and his recounting of the case to Kirby demonstrate his continuing interest in the Italian language in Ireland and in Italians in the country. In the new Catholic University of Ireland, in which Cullen was centrally involved, a lecturer in Italian Augusto Cesare Marani was one of the original appointments when that institution opened in 1854.⁷³ Furthermore, in the Catholic University there were lectures on Dante's *Inferno* and one of four strands that students could be examined in was a modern language and literature.⁷⁴

An interesting element of Cullen's linguistic career is his apparent indifference to the Irish language. He never communicated in the language and unlike MacHale in Tuam, appears to have little interest in either the promotion or the usage of Irish. In this attitude, he had much in common with the rest of the Catholic Church in Ireland in the nineteenth century as, apart from notable exceptions such as Archbishop MacHale, the Church did not interest itself with the Irish language during Cullen's time.⁷⁵ Cullen's only mention of Irish occurs in his belief that it was important to have Irish-speaking priests in Irish-speaking areas but he equally applied this belief to Ireland as to the far-flung corners of the world as all priests, in Cullen's opinion, if they were to succeed needed a mastery of the native tongue. He was aware of work in Irish and at one stage wrote of poetry in Irish written in pagan times and compared this poetry to the poems of Ossian which had been translated into Italian by Cesarotti.⁷⁶ In his time in Rome he met the polyglot Cardinal Mezzofanti who he reported 'is capable of shaming all the Irish that come to Italy, for he understands our original language

perfectly, whilst unfortunately very few Irish here are able to speak a word of it.'⁷⁷ Cullen facilitated and encouraged his nephew Patrick Moran in his research in Rome into sources for the history of the Irish church. These sources were often important documents in Irish but it was the history of the church rather than the history of the Irish language that interested Cullen. Apart from brief mentions such as in the above examples, the Irish language and literature do not feature in Cullen's correspondence. There is no evidence of any use of Irish in his writing and his indifference to the language contrasts sharply with his support for the learning and use of other languages.

Final years

The very last letter written by Cullen in Italian, less than three weeks before his death in October 1878, demonstrates his continuing ability to communicate proficiently in Italian. However, it also contains an admission of lack of contact with the Italian language and diminishing access to source texts in that tongue. Cullen had been asked by Propaganda to suggest Italian books which might be translated into English. He brings Cardinal Simeoni's attention the fact that for almost thirty years he has not been able to keep abreast of the books published in Italy because the booksellers in Dublin are generally Protestant, do not do much business with Italy, and do not import modern books. He claims that they only bring in anti-Papal and anti-Church treatises. There is a melancholic tone to this letter as Cullen makes his limitations known to Propaganda. Undaunted by this however, he nevertheless makes various suggestions of books that might be translated, for example *Vita di Cristo* by Menochio; *Roma ed i Papi* by C. Tullio Dandolo, and *Il gius canonico* by Monsignor Nardi.⁷⁸ Despite the distance in time and place so wistfully noted by Cullen at the outset, he is still knowledgeable about some Italian books and able to make a few suggestions (just probably not as many as he would like). He is disappointed that so few Italian books are to be found in Dublin but even in the final few weeks of his life, he is able to name these Italian books and still function as an intermediary between Rome and Ireland providing information for the former on the latter.

Conclusion:

Paul Cullen's language skills served him throughout his life in his role as an agent and liaison, a linking figure between different worlds. His linguistic abilities and translations gave an early jump start to his career and subsequently expanded his sphere of influence from the confines of the Vatican to the vast expanses of the Catholic English-speaking world. Although immersed in a multilingual church in Rome, he quickly learned that the language of the Vatican was Italian and it was through this medium that he became, in the words of Gearóid Ó Tuathaigh, 'the gatekeeper, the arbiter of virtually all aspects of Irish Catholic development'⁷⁹ He maintained the connections that he made in his early years in Rome by means of constant communication in Italian and positioned himself as a vital conduit for Irish-Vatican relations. By this means he came to be the dominant force in Irish Catholicism

for almost thirty years, connecting Ireland to Rome and translating his ambitions and those of Vatican into reality in Ireland.

Bibliography

- Andrews, Hilary. *The Lion of the West : A Biography of John Machale*. Dublin: Veritas, 2001.
- Barr, Colin. "'An Ambiguous Awe': Paul Cullen and the Historians." In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 414-34. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- . "'Imperium in Imperio': Irish Episcopal Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century." *The English Historical Review* 123, no. 502 (2008): 611-50.
- . "The Irish College, Rome, and the Appointment of Irish Bishops to the United States, 1830-1851." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 102-15. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.
- . *Paul Cullen, John Henry Newman, and the Catholic University of Ireland, 1845-1865*. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003.
- Barr, Colin, Michele Finelli, and Anne O'Connor. *Nation/Nazione: Irish Nationalism and the Italian Risorgimento*. Dublin, Ireland: University College Dublin Press, 2013.
- Bowen, Desmond. *Paul Cardinal Cullen and the Shaping of Modern Irish Catholicism*. Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1983.
- Carroll, Clare. "'The Spiritual Government of the Entire World': A Memorial for the Irish College Rome, January 1783." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 64-82. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.
- Corish, Patrick J. *Maynooth College : 1795-1995*. Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 1995.
- Duffy, Eamon. "The Age of Pio Nono: The Age of Paul Cullen." In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh & Albert McDonnell. 47-60. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- Fenning, Hugh. "Irishmen Ordained at Rome, 1760 - 1800." *Archivium Hibernicum* 51 (1997): 16-37.
- Ferriter, Diarmuid. "Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World." *Irish Times*, 10 September 2011.
- Keogh, Dáire, and Albert McDonnell. *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- Korten, Christopher. "Converging Worlds: Paul Cullen in the World of Mauro Cappellari." In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 34-46. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- . "A Divine Language: The Role of Angielski in the Roman Catholic Church in the 18th and 19th Centuries." In *Comparative Studies in Anglophone Literatures*, edited by Grzegorz Konecki. 137-52. Torun: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika, 2012.
- Larkin, Emmet "Paul Cullen: The Great Ultramontane ". In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 15-33. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- Lee, Joseph. *The Modernisation of Irish Society, 1848-1918*. Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1973.
- Loneragan, Corinna Salvadori "Dove 'L Si Sona: Two Hundred and Thirty Years of Italian in Trinity College Dublin." In *Italian Culture: Interactions, Transpositions, Translations*, edited by Corinna Salvadori & John Scattergood Cormac Ó Cuilleain. 13-28. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2006.
- Macaulay, Ambrose. "The Irish College, Rome and the Land War." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell., 188-204. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.

- . "'Strong Views...In Very Strong Forms": Paul Cullen, Archbishop of Armagh (1849-1852)". In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 78-98. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- MacSuibhne, Peadar. *Paul Cullen and His Contemporaries: With Their Letters from 1820-1902*. Naas, Ire.: Leinster Leader, 1961.
- McCrea, Daniel. "The Late Most Rev. Dr. Kirby, Archbishop of Ephesus." *The Irish Ecclesiastical Record* xvii (September 1896): 770-78.
- Moffitt, Miriam. "The Conversion of Connemara and Conflict between Paul Cullen and John Machale." In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 231-42. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- O'Carroll, Ciarán. "The Papal Brigade of St. Patrick." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 167-87. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.
- O'Connor, Anne. "The Pope, the Prelate, the Soldiers and the Controversy: Paul Cullen and the Irish Papal Brigade." In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 329-49. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- O'Connor, Thomas. "Luke Wadding's Networks at Home and Abroad." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 14-23. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.
- Ó Tuathaigh, Gearóid "Reassessing Paul Cullen: An Afterword." In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 435-44. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- Olden, Michael. "Tobias Kirby (1804-1895)." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 131-48. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.
- Rafferty, Oliver P. "The Ultramontane Spirituality of Paul Cullen". In *Cardinal Paul Cullen and His World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 61-77. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011.
- Russell, Charles William. *The Life of Cardinal Mezzofanti*. London,: Longman, Brown, and co., 1858.
- Sweetman, Rory. "'Waving the Green Flag" in the Southern Hemisphere: The Kellys and the Irish College Rome." In *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. 205-24. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008.
- Venuti, Lawrence. *The Translator's Invisibility : A History of Translation*. Translation Studies. London; New York: Routledge, 1995.

¹ See the many articles on various aspects of Cullen's career in Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell, *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his world* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011). Eamon Duffy has called him 'the father of modern Irish Catholicism' Eamon Duffy, "The age of Pio Nono: the age of Paul Cullen," in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh & Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011), 47. Diarmuid Ferriter said he was 'the towering figure of modern Irish Catholicism' Diarmuid Ferriter, "Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World," *Irish Times*, 10 September 2011.

² *Times*, 25 October 1878, quoted in Colin Barr, "'An ambiguous awe": Paul Cullen and the historians," in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011), 414.

³ Desmond Bowen, *Paul Cardinal Cullen and the shaping of modern Irish Catholicism* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1983). xi.

⁴ Cullen to Hugh Cullen, 22 January 1821, in Peadar MacSuibhne, *Paul Cullen and his contemporaries: with their letters from 1820-1902* (Naas, Ire.: Leinster Leader, 1961). 1.78.

⁵ James Maher to Margaret Cullen, 5 April 1821, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.84.

-
- ⁶ James Maher to Margaret Cullen, 17 July 1821, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1. 89.
- ⁷ Cullen to Hugh Cullen, January 1822, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.99.
- ⁸ Cullen to Margaret Cullen, c.10 August 1822, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1. 109.
- ⁹ Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.359.
- ¹⁰ Cullen to Hugh Cullen, 25 January 1829, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.142.
- ¹¹ The Sacred Congregation *de Propaganda Fide*, whose official title is "sacra congregatio christiano nomini propagando" is the department of the pontifical administration charged with the spread of Catholicism and with the regulation of ecclesiastical affairs in non-Catholic countries. The seminary of the Propaganda is known as the Collegium Urbanum (Urban College) and it is there that Irish students in Rome conducted their studies.
- ¹² Christopher Korten, "Converging worlds: Paul Cullen in the world of Mauro Cappellari," in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011), 40.
- ¹³ Even in his earliest years in Rome, Cullen was called upon to translate: in 1823 he presented a pastoral letter from Dr. Doyle to the Rector of Propaganda who then made him translate it into Italian. Cullen to Margaret Cullen, 7 December 1823, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1. 121. Cullen even had to translate into Italian for the Propaganda the letter from Dr. Doyle requesting that Cullen be sent back to Ireland to work as a professor in Carlow College. Cullen to James Maher, 10 October 1829, in Mac Suibhne, 1.149.
- ¹⁴ See Lawrence Venuti, *The translator's invisibility : a history of translation*, Translation studies (London; New York: Routledge, 1995).
- ¹⁵ See in particular the archival material held in Pontifical Irish College Rome (PICR), CUL/NC/2 relating to this period in Cullen's life.
- ¹⁶ Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.10.
- ¹⁷ PICR, CUL/ NC/2/186 See also PICR CUL/ NC/2/172.
- ¹⁸ Cullen to James Maher, 10 October 1829, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.149.
- ¹⁹ Mac Suibhne says that Cullen 'was associated with Wiseman in his work for the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain in the early thirties. He was on the translation committee and among the works they arranged to translate was a history of Mecca and a history of the Circassian dynasty of the Mamelukes.' 1.10.
- ²⁰ PICR, CUL/NC/1/42.
- ²¹ Charles William Russell, *The life of Cardinal Mezzofanti* (London,: Longman, Brown, and co., 1858).
- ²² Korten, "Converging worlds," 40.
- ²³ Russell, *The Life of Cardinal Mezzofanti*, 297-8. Russell continues by saying that Mezzofanti subsequently met 'a Turkish student, named Hassun, now archbishop of the United Greek Church at Constantinople. He at once entered into conversation with Hassun in Turkish. This he speedily changed to Romaic with a youth named Musabini, who is now the Catholic Greek bishop at Smyrna. From Greek he turned to English, on the approach of Dr. O'Connor, an Irish student, now bishop of Pittsburgh in the United States. As the unwonted sounds began to attract attention, the students poured in, one by one, each in succession to find himself greeted in his native tongue ; till at length, the bell being rung, the entire community assembled, and gave full scope to the wonderful quickness and variety of his accomplishment.' Russell, 298. This was the multilingual environment in which Cullen lived for many years.
- ²⁴ PICR, CUL/NC/3/3/28. See also the high regard he shows for Mezzofanti in Cullen to Margaret Cullen, January 1833, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1.201.

- ²⁵ Christopher Korten, "A Divine Language: The role of Angielski in the Roman Catholic Church in the 18th and 19th centuries," in *Comparative Studies in Anglophone Literatures*, ed. Grzegorz Koneckniak (Torun: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika, 2012), 137.
- ²⁶ Colin Barr, "The Irish College, Rome, and the appointment of Irish bishops to the United States, 1830-1851," in *The Irish College, Rome and its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008), 112.
- ²⁷ Colin Barr, "'Imperium in Imperio': Irish Episcopal Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century," *The English Historical Review* 123, no. 502 (2008).
- ²⁸ Examples of these letters with requests for Cullen's linguistic interventions include: PICR CUL/1551 28 February 1847 (Letter from W. Higgins); PICR CUL/NC/4/1838/11 (Letter from Dr. Murray, Archbishop of Dublin); PICR CUL/NC/4/1844/47 (Letter from P. Cooper).
- ²⁹ Korten, "A Divine Language," 146.
- ³⁰ See Clare Carroll, "'The Spiritual Government of the Entire World': A memorial for the Irish College Rome, January 1783," in *The Irish College, Rome and its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008), 72-82. Carroll notes that by 1783 'Propaganda Fide was pressing for a kind of cultural homogenization where Italian as much as Latin would be the *lingua franca*', 82.
- ³¹ In performing this role, Cullen was continuing a tradition of Irish intermediaries in Rome, a role occupied in previous centuries by figures such as Luke Wadding and Peter Lombard. On the former, see for example Thomas O'Connor, "Luke Wadding's networks at home and abroad," in *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008).
- ³² Cullen to Fransoni, 26 September 1849, Archives of Propaganda Fide (APF) SC, Irlanda, Vol. 30, f. 214 (r) – 215 (v). The eventual appointment of Cullen himself to vacant see of Armagh is discussed in Ambrose Macaulay, "'Strong views...in very strong forms': Paul Cullen, archbishop of Armagh (1849-1852)" in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011).
- ³³ Cullen to Fransoni, 7 October 1849, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 30, f. 213 (r+v)).
- ³⁴ Brian Condon: Diary of John Thomas Hynes, 1843-1868
<http://www.library.unisa.edu.au/condon/Hynes/July1843.htm>. Accessed July 2013.
- ³⁵ Emmet Larkin, "Paul Cullen: the great ultramontane" in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011), 32.
- ³⁶ Cullen to Fransoni, 26 June 1852, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 31, f. 197-200 (v). Other examples of Cullen translating for Irish priests for the Vatican include: Cullen to Barnabò, 7 January 1859, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 33, f. 836 (r); Cullen to Fransoni, 21 February 1853, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 31, ff. 394-395 (v); Cullen to Fransoni, 12 January 1853, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 31, ff. 348-349 (v).
- ³⁷ Cullen to Kirby, 8 June 1852, Pontifical Irish College Rome (PICR), KIR.NC.1.1852.35. For an example of Cullen's use of Kirby to translate documents in order to influence ecclesiastical affairs in Scotland, see Colin Barr, "Imperium in Imperio," 640.
- ³⁸ Cullen to Smith, 21 October 1851 (Bernard Smith Papers, Rome). Also Cullen to Smith 29 March 1851 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1851.26; Cullen to Smith, 24 April 1852 (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 31, ff. 166 (r) -167 (v)
- ³⁹ Cullen to Kirby, 26 October 1863 (APF), SC, Irlanda, vol. 35, ff. 121 (r) – 122 (r). See also Cullen to Kirby 30 May 1852 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1852.33; Cullen to Kirby 16 February 1853 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.
- ⁴⁰ Cullen to Kirby 10 January 1851 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1851.3. In a subsequent letter, Cullen hopes to have the pastoral published also in a Roman paper. Cullen to Kirby 1 March 1851 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1851.16
- ⁴¹ For example, Cullen to Barnabò, D. August 1866, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 35, f. 812 (r) – 813 (r). See also Kirby to Propaganda, 8 February 1851, APF, SC Irlanda 30, fo. 556.
- ⁴² Cullen to Kirby, Octave of St. John (January) 1860, (PICR), KIR/NC/1/1860/3.

-
- ⁴³ Cullen to Barnabò, 2 March 1864, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 34, ff. 1085 (r) – 1090 (r)).
- ⁴⁴ See also, 'The forenamed priest has written a letter to me about this matter, which I am enclosing in the original for Your Most Reverend Eminence, knowing that Monsignor Rinaldini will be able to read it in English, or Your Eminence will be able to have it translated into Italian by Fr. Moran or by Monsignor Kirby.' Cullen to Barnabò, 23 January 1863, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 34, ff. 605 (r) – 606 (v).; See also Cullen to Barnabò, 13 January 1853, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 31, ff. 351-352 (v).
- ⁴⁵ Cullen to Fransoni, 25 March 1856, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 32, f. 757; Cullen to Barnabò, 4 March 1867 (DDA) CLB 5; Cullen to Barnabò, 9 March 1866 (DDA) CLB 5.
- ⁴⁶ Both Cullen and Kirby were supremely confident in Italian: a former student said of his first meeting with Kirby in Rome, 'Now and then, during our conversation, he made use of Italian words, and then explained himself in English.' Daniel McCrea, "The late most Rev. Dr. Kirby, Archbishop of Ephesus," *The Irish Ecclesiastical Record* xvii(1896): 770.
- ⁴⁷ Cullen to Kirby 20 March 1851 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1851.25.
48 (PICR) KIR/NC/1/1860/103. For more on Cullen's involvement in the Papal Brigade see Anne O'Connor, "The Pope, the Prelate, the Soldiers and the Controversy: Paul Cullen and the Irish Papal Brigade," in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011).; Ciarán O'Carroll, "The Papal Brigade of St. Patrick," in *The Irish College, Rome and its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008).
- ⁴⁹ Cullen to Kirby, 3 January 1852, (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1852.9.
- ⁵⁰ Cullen to Barnabò, 31 January 1865, Dublin Diocesan Archives (DDA) CLB 5, 186 – 189.
- ⁵¹ Cullen to Barnabò, 9 September 1863, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 35, ff. 105 (r) – 109 (v))
- ⁵² Cullen to Barnabò, 2 July 1858, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 33, f. 725
- ⁵³ Cullen to Franchi, 9 April 1877, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 37, ff. 927 (r) – 928 (v) See also Cullen to Bishop of Liège, D. February 1871, (DDA), CLB 4, 495 – 496.
- ⁵⁴ See Bowen, *Paul Cardinal Cullen*, 18. Cullen however fell out with Bernard Smith by about 1855.
- ⁵⁵ Ambrose Macaulay, "The Irish College, Rome and the land war," in *The Irish College, Rome and Its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008), 190.
- ⁵⁶ Larkin, "Paul Cullen: the great ultramontane," 16. On Cullen's ultramontanism, see also Oliver P. Rafferty, "The ultramontane spirituality of Paul Cullen " in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011).
- ⁵⁷ Hilary Andrews, *The lion of the west : a biography of John MacHale* (Dublin: Veritas, 2001). 21.
- ⁵⁸ Some of his translations include: Moore's *Melodies* into Irish (1841); *The Way of the Cross* as *Toras na Chroice* (1854); translation into Irish of *Pentateuch* (1861); and Homer's *Iliad* (Bk. 1 1844; Bk. II 1851; Bk. III 1851; Bk. IV 1857; Bks. V & VI 1860; Bk. VII 1871). For a comprehensive list see Andrews, *The Lion of the West*, 311-316.
- ⁵⁹ On some of the many flashpoints between Cullen and MacHale see Colin Barr, *Paul Cullen, John Henry Newman, and the Catholic University of Ireland, 1845-1865* (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003).; Andrews, *The Lion of the West*, 215-229; Miriam Moffitt, "The Conversion of Connemara and Conflict between Paul Cullen and John MacHale," in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011).
- ⁶⁰ Joseph Lee, *The modernisation of Irish society, 1848-1918* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1973). 425.
- ⁶¹ On the French influence see Patrick J. Corish, *Maynooth College : 1795-1995* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 1995). 26-32. Corish goes as far as to call Maynooth a 'rustic Sorbonne', *ibid.* 60. On Cullen's denunciation of Maynooth's Gallicanism to Rome, see for example Cullen to Fransoni, 2 December 1855, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 32, f.588.
- ⁶² See for example, Hugh Fenning, "Irishmen Ordained at Rome, 1760 - 1800," *Archivum Hibernicum* 51(1997).
- ⁶³ Cullen to Kirby D. August 1852 (PICR) KIR.NC.1852.41. He was also critical of the French language skills in Ireland: Cullen to Simeoni, 13 April 1871, (PICR) CLB 5
- ⁶⁴ Cullen to Unknown, Y-M-D (DDA) CLB 593-594.

-
- ⁶⁵ Bowen, *Paul Cardinal Cullen*, 25.
- ⁶⁶ Korten, "A divine language," 146.
- ⁶⁷ McCrea "The late most Rev. Dr. Kirby," 775.
- ⁶⁸ For example, one student James Wood wrote that Cullen obtained a master in Latin and Italian for him and that he could study those the rest of the year. James Wood to John Baptist Purcell, 26 February 1838, II-4-g A.L.S. <http://www.archives.nd.edu/cgi-bin/author.pl?cal1838.htm+Wood>. The active use of Italian in the Irish College declined in the years following Cullen and Kirby's rectorships when they were no longer present to drive home the importance of mastering the language. See Rory Sweetman, "'Waving the green flag' in the southern hemisphere: The Kellys and the Irish College Rome," in *The Irish College, Rome and its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008), 211.
- ⁶⁹ Cullen to Barnabò, 26 May 1869, DDA, CLB 5.
- ⁷⁰ Cullen to Barnabò, D. May 1872, DDA, CLB 5.
- ⁷¹ For example, Father Burke in Cullen to Barnabò, 16 February 1865, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 35, f. 200 (r); Fr. O'Hagan in Cullen to Unknown, 13 July 1873, DDA, CLB5.
- ⁷² Cullen to Kirby, 5 September 1856 (PICR) KIR.NC.1.1856.43. See Corinna Salvadori Lonergan, "Dove 'l sì sona: two hundred and thirty years of Italian in Trinity College Dublin," in *Italian Culture: Interactions, transpositions, translations*, ed. Corinna Salvadori & John Scattergood Cormac Ó Cuilleain (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2006). In her article, Lonergan details the high profile court case and subsequent media coverage in 1856 over the appointment to the chair of Italian and French in TCD of Basilio Angeli, see 16-19.
- ⁷³ See Barr, *Paul Cullen, John Henry Newman*, 209. Marani was also responsible for teaching Spanish; See also Colin Barr, Michele Finelli, and Anne O'Connor, *Nation/Nazione: Irish nationalism and the Italian Risorgimento* (Dublin, Ireland: University College Dublin Press, 2013).
- ⁷⁴ Barr, *Paul Cullen, John Henry Newman*, 213-5.
- ⁷⁵ Like Cullen, Tobias Kirby is reported to have only ever used a handful of Irish words in his writing, see Michael Olden, "Tobias Kirby (1804-1895)," in *The Irish College, Rome and its World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008), 136.
- ⁷⁶ Cullen to Barnabò, 1 April 1864, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 35, ff. 43 (r) – 46 (v). He is also mentioned as being present during a discussion with the pope on the possible Irish origins of a new work of Sir William Betham, *Etruria Celtica* — in which an attempt is made to establish the identity of the Irish and Etrurian languages, and in which the celebrated Eugubian inscriptions are explained as Irish. It is said Dr. Cullen recounted the nature and object of the work to the pope. See Russell, *The Life of Cardinal Mezzofanti*, 423.
- ⁷⁷ Cullen to Margaret Cullen, 12 November 1831, in Mac Suibhne, *Paul Cullen and his Contemporaries*, 1. 191.
- ⁷⁸ Cullen to Simeoni, 4 October 1878, (APF) SC, Irlanda, vol. 38, f. 143 (r + v)
- ⁷⁹ Gearóid Ó Tuathaigh, "Reassessing Paul Cullen: an afterword," in *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his World*, ed. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011), 437.