



Provided by the author(s) and NUI Galway in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite the published version when available.

Title	Industrial Schools and identification: Revisiting the total institution
Author(s)	Kenny, Kate
Publication Date	2011
Publication Information	Kenny, K. (2011) Industrial Schools and identification: Revisiting the total institution Identities and Critical Management Studies stream at the 7th International Critical Management Studies Conference, Naples, Italy
Link to publisher's version	<a href="http://www.organizzazione.unina.it/cms7/">http://www.organizzazione.unina.it/cms7/</a>
Item record	<a href="http://hdl.handle.net/10379/2703">http://hdl.handle.net/10379/2703</a>

Downloaded 2023-03-23T11:57:13Z

Some rights reserved. For more information, please see the item record link above.



## **Industrial Schools and identification: Revisiting the total institution**

Dr. Kate Kenny  
School of Political Science and Sociology  
National University of Ireland  
Galway  
Ireland  
tel: +353 (91) 495401  
email: [kate.kenny@nuigalway.ie](mailto:kate.kenny@nuigalway.ie)

Paper prepared for **Identities and Critical Management Studies** stream  
At the 7th International Critical Management Studies Conference  
11-13 July 2011  
University of Naples Federico II – Naples

### **Abstract**

In this paper, I revisit a forgotten empirical site, Ireland's industrial schools. Thousands of children lived and worked in these organizations from an early age until adulthood. They were hidden from mainstream Irish society, and their complaints about systematic physical and sexual abuse were continuously ignored. Recently, some survivor accounts have emerged. Exploring these, I draw on a concept that is no longer in fashion among organization scholars: Erving Goffman's notion of the total institution. Specifically, I examine his ideas on selfhood within such institutions. Building on these, and in light of evidence from Ireland's industrial schools, I consider emerging work within organization studies that engages with poststructural psychoanalysis to understand selfhood, affect and subjectivity. In this way, this paper proposes to explore new avenues for researching an under-studied aspect of organizational life.

### **Why revisit Total Institutions?**

Organization theory has, in the main, failed to address the role that organizations play in crises of humanity. Interestingly, while case studies of knowledge workers, office managers and professional creatives have proliferated in the past ten years, the discipline remains largely silent on the part played by organizations in facilitating large-scale, systematic suffering on the people that work in them (Fotaki, 2007). Despite possessing the theoretical tools, such as Goffman's work on the total institution, and Bauman's account of the organization of the Holocaust, organization scholars have largely ignored such topics (Clegg 2006: 426). This is unfortunate given that many of the most horrific acts carried out by humans involve significant projects of organization.

In addition to understanding other total institutions, studies of these settings can help us understand more common forms of organizations; for Goffman, extreme and 'abnormal' examples of organizations can yield important insights into 'normal' settings. From analyses of how people experience stigma (1967), to the experiences of inmates in psychiatric asylums (1961), Goffman continually provides illustrations of this idea. In the case of total institutions, these represent an 'ideal type' of organization: an extreme form in which experiences of organizational power and domination are amplified (Clegg 2006: 427; Shenkar 1996: 886; Saffold 1988). Particularly relevant for this paper is Goffman's idea that total institutions can help us develop our understanding of the interaction between self and organization; by discussing how the self operates in an environment in which extreme

oppression and degradation is experienced, we can gain insight into the relation between the self and a less 'benign and less totalistic' institution (Goffman, 1961: 279). Specifically, for Goffman, studying such settings can illuminate aspects of peoples' dependence on structures of power in their self-constitution, even in situations that are not so constrained.

### **A forgotten empirical site**

The high walls of large industrial schools such as Artane on the outskirts of Dublin, kept the people who spent entire childhoods there hidden from view. Recent reports of the sexual, physical and emotional abuse that occurred at such places have emerged (Ryan, 2009a), only to be followed quickly by official government apologies, reluctant financial compensations from the Catholic congregations who were responsible for running the schools, and an overall sense of closure around the topic (O'Regan, 2010). Industrial schools typically ran enterprises staffed by children, including farming, baking, tailoring and ironmongering. Throughout the last century, Irish children identified as being in need were placed in these industrial schools, admitted at five years old or younger and remaining for nine years on average. They typically came from large families on low incomes, from unmarried mothers, or their parents had passed away (Ryan, 2009b). Others had a disability or mental illness, or had been victims of parental cruelty. A small percentage had committed a crime, invariably prompted by scarcity of food and money (Scanlan, 2006: 72). Ireland in the 1940s-1960s was struggling with poverty (O'Connell and Smyth, 2006: 285), and was a place in which sexual abuse was common in society, an uncomfortable fact for an ostensibly devout Catholic nation (Ferriter, 2009). For these reasons, industrial school children represented both the moral dirt of society (Ferguson, 2007), being associated with unmarried mothers and sexual abuse, but also the economic dirt, invariably coming from the poorest families. Against an Irish nation that was struggling economically and desperately trying to maintain a pious religious identity, therefore, the children who lived and worked in industrial schools, and who were victims of horrific abuse, represented a dark and unspoken side of Irish society. Accounts from boys who had been to Artane highlight how a sense of being excluded and stigmatized persisted even into later life, as young adults were tarred with the label of being 'industrial school boys', years after leaving (Ryan, 2009c; Touher, 2007).

The experiences of such children remained hidden; even those who attempted to write their own stories as adults were discouraged by publishers from including details of sexual abuse, up until the 1990s (Touher, 2007). Reports were kept out of the media both from lack of interest on the part of the public (Ryan, 2009a) and as a result of active coercion by senior members of the Catholic church (Morgan, 2009: 230). Irish sociologists have in general avoided addressing the subject in any depth, and the topic has not yet appeared in organization studies, despite the fact that these schools were work organizations.

### **An archaic theory?**

Theoretically, Industrial Schools can be understood as instances of Goffman's (1961) 'total institutions', a concept developed through his covert study of life at St. Elizabeth's psychiatric hospital. A total institution is a place where one lives, works, sleeps and eats in the same location with the same people, under a general, rational planned system (ibid: 17; Wallace, 1971), and inmates are restricted from engaging with those outside. These features marked Ireland's industrial school system: large numbers of children were housed, fed and trained within the walls of these institutions, which themselves were run on a military system of organization (Touher, 2007: 15). Although Goffman's work has been recently drawn on by organization scholars to understand for example impression management (Giacalone and Rosenfeld, 1991), or the enactment of management practice (Mangham and Overington, 1987), interest in the concept of the total institution appears to have faded since the work of Burrell (1984) apart from some exceptions (Shenkar, 1996; Scott, 2010; Tracy, 2000). In this paper, I examine this somewhat ignored empirical setting, along with the concept of the total institution. In doing so, I attempt to re-ignite questions of selfhood in light of recent

developments in organizational scholarship, which focus on affective attachments to power, in relation to the self.

### **Goffman's Spatial Metaphor**

As with much of his work, Goffman's *Asylums* contains an implicit critique of cruel and dominant forms of power such as those found in asylums like St. Elizabeth's (Hardy and Clegg, 2006), and he draws on the concept of 'self' to reinforce this point. For Goffman, entry to a total institution involves a series of rituals in which one's sense of individuality is gradually stripped away. These 'mortifications' (1961:31) include being assigned identical clothes and being relieved of personal possessions, upon arriving at an institution. There follows a process of merging one's identity with that of the organization, reinforced by daily rituals of degradation and continued denial of individuality by staff and others. When writing about the self in this process, Goffman draws on a spatial metaphor. The self is a site of continual negotiation; actors struggle to defend the territories of the 'real' self against institutional colonization (see for example Goffman 1961: 155). Spaces, or 'territories' of the self can be material, involving the physical body or possessions, or ideal, involving inner conceptions of self-identity (1961: 32). In *Relations in Public* (1971), he outlines the eight types of territory, and this way of thinking informs Goffman's concept of self that appears throughout *Asylums* (Lemert and Branaman, 1996).

In a total institution, the opportunity for self-definition is limited; there is little room to exert the normal strategies of defending one's 'self-spaces' and maintaining a coherent self-image in the eyes of other people, and oneself.

'The self in this sense is not a property of the person to whom it is attributed, but dwells rather in the pattern of social control that is exerted in connexion with the person by himself and those around him.' (Goffman, 1961: 154)

In this way, Goffman sees the inmate's 'self' as largely influenced by the particular structures and rules of the organization, which do 'not so much support the self as constitute it' (Goffman, 1961: 154). In particular, attempts to outwardly defend the self can be counter-productive, for example, when assertions of alternative, non-institutional identities are mocked and 'deflated' by staff, sometimes resulting in punishment (1961: 144). Such attempts can cease to be practical for inmates of the total institution and can be abandoned. It appears therefore that Goffman's total institutions effectively determine the possible forms of self that might emerge in such settings (Dennis and Martin, 2005: 191); these are places in which we would 'least expect to find pluralism and difference' (Hardy and Clegg 2006: 758). Tracy (2000) illustrates this with a study of employees on a cruise ship, which she interprets as a total institution, and finds that identity is co-constructed along the lines of powerful discourses, leaving little room for staff to engage in alternative ideas of self. Within a total institution like this, she notes, 'employees find it an arduous task to maintain conversations or ideas that are inconsistent with the homogeneous discourse' (2000:120).

Rather than taking a determinist position, however, Goffman is at pains to show how resistance to such colonization persists, even in oppressive environments (1961: 172). In the essay *The Underlife of a Public Institution*, he points out that engaging in small resistances (or 'secondary adjustments') necessarily accompanies life in a total institution. While on the surface, inmates go through a phase of 'primary adjustment', ostensibly identifying with the available forms of self and adopting the role of a programmed member of the institution, the individual simultaneously engages in an 'underlife,' variably resisting institutional identities and adopting a range of alternatives. Other studies of total institutions demonstrate how inmates enact such reinventions of the self: some passive, some active but none determined completely by the institution (Jenkins 2008; Scott 2010). Paterniti (2000) examines the micro-politics of identification of nurse aids in a total institution from a participant observer's perspective, similarly finding that patients construct ongoing personal narratives. As Goffman notes, whenever we closely observe what goes on in any form of social organization, we 'always find the individual employing methods to keep some distance,

some elbow room, between himself and that with which others assume he should be identified' (1961: 279). In some cases however, these secondary forms of resistance remain minor and hidden, and in the face of overwhelming colonization of the territories of self, inmates of total institutions can simply relinquish the 'game of self-defence'. This can happen in institutions where the prescribed 'self' is simply too difficult to maintain coherently, and where the rules that determine the nature of this self keep changing. So for example, where mixed messages are given, or punishment confusingly accompanies attempts to comply with the required identity, there appears little point in persisting with the project of self-constitution, and it comes to be abandoned altogether. In place, an apathetic stance towards the game of defending the self is adopted, and disinvestment in the project occurs (1961:151). The actor chooses to surrender, and so overall for Goffman, rather than being determined, selfhood is an active negotiation of positions. Our social status 'is backed by the solid buildings of the world, while our sense of personal identity often resides in the cracks' (ibid).

Whether defending the self, engaging in resistances, or actively and knowingly surrendering the 'game', we see a strong sense of agency exhibited by actors in these accounts of self-constitution in the context of total institutions (Scott 2010: 214). Goffman's self is a 'stance-taking entity, a something that takes up a position somewhere between identification with an organization and opposition to it, and is ready at the slightest pressure to regain its balance by shifting its involvement in either direction' (1961: 280). The constitution of self is a territorial battle in which a struggle takes place to reserve something of one's own 'pure' self and keep it free from a colonized institutional one. Since the publication of *Asylums*, this spatial/ agentic metaphor has largely informed authors' understanding of the relation between the subject-self and institutional power within total institutions. Studies tend to focus on the conditions under which inmates can exert agency, how this is prevented by excessive domination (Scott 2010), and the ways in which negotiations over territories of the self play out over time (Shenkar 1996; Tracy, 2000). In this paper, I argue that this concept of agentic struggle over the territories of the self falls somewhat short of depicting peoples' experiences in total institutions. I suggest that we can deepen our notion of self within such contexts, and in doing so, we can understand in more depth the relation between self and power.

### **Butler's Ideas**

Judith Butler's contributions to critical theory, cultural studies, queer theory and feminism are well known (Lloyd, 2007). Relevant to this paper, her work focuses on the constitution of self amid flows of power, and is considered to be among the most valuable and 'rigorously argued' approaches to the study of identification in contemporary theory (Hall, 2000: 28). Her approach is to rework Foucault's ideas on power, drawing on insights from psychoanalysis and gender theory (Butler, 1990). Addressing questions of how people come to identify with forms of power, Butler takes up Foucault's point that norms are reproduced at the local level of practice by the actions of myriad individuals. Foucault is 'notoriously taciturn' (1997: 18), she argues, in relation to how and why this occurs, largely due to his reluctance to focus on issues of the individual self. Taking up this question, Butler explores how and why people come to identify with norms that persist in society. She notes that an 'account of subjection... must be traced in the turns of psychic life' (1997: 18). Butler's work on identification therefore involves the project of tracing these turns, asking questions on how, for example, the 'formation of the subject involves the regulatory formation of the psyche' (1997: 18).

For Butler, this 'regulatory formation' occurs because the psyche is always-already inscribed by forms of power; 'the terms that make up one's own gender are, from the start, outside oneself, beyond oneself in a sociality that has no single author' (Butler, 2004: 1). Subjects are inescapably attached to particular terms, even though these are exterior to them. This occurs because of a persistent desire for recognition which accompanies our maturing into adulthood; we need to feel that we are legitimate beings, in relation to the particular norms

that persist in our social contexts. This becomes quite clear when the subject experiences the feeling of exclusion from dominant norms; pain and abjection accompany such transgressions, the subject is deemed an 'impossible being' and is denied a recognizable status, becoming 'foreclosed from possibility' (Butler, 2004: 31). The fear of being excluded and 'impossible' is what fuels a desire to be recognized. It causes the subject to identify with particular normative frameworks, even where this subjection may hurt (Butler, 1993, see also (Hook 2007; Stavrakakis 2002). So there is an ambivalent, bittersweet tinge to identification; it can offer us both a sense of place and belonging, and yet can sometimes cause us pain and injury: 'called by an injurious name, I come into social being... I am led to embrace the terms that injure me because they constitute me socially' (Butler, 1997: 104). The pain of abjection and the joy of acceptance are, for Butler, central in the study of identification. People are bound to each other, and to forms of power, through passion and desire. Growing up, children learn that there is 'no possibility of not loving, where love is bound up with the requirements of life' (Butler, 1997: 8). These 'passionate attachments', displays of affect and its absence, are what connects us to forms of power, and this can be seen by the observer. To try and understand how identification operates therefore, it is important to be attentive to the emotions that accompany subjection, to the 'passion and grief and rage we feel, all of which tear us from ourselves, bind us to others, transport us, undo us, and implicate us in lives that are not our own, sometimes fatally, irreversibly' (Butler, 2004: 20).

In the above outline of Butler's ideas, we see how the spatial aspect of identification is turned around; identification is a radically exterior phenomenon; 'power that at first appears as external, pressed upon the subject, pressing the subject into subordination, assumes a psychic form that constitutes the subject's self-identity' (1997: 3). Social, political or economic norms that we might assume to operate 'outside' of the subject can inscribe the 'internal' psyche. To gain the status of legitimate subject in the face of certain norms, and to be recognized by others in this way, is to be 'cast, always, outside oneself, Other to oneself' by the psychic desires that compel us (Butler, 2004: 148; 1997). In turn, these psychic processes constitute and ensure the reproduction of particular powerful norms through peoples' identifications. It is clear that Butler rejects the notion that the subject exists prior to subjection, but rather the subject is formed through desirous positioning in relation to power. This formation is the result of patterns of desires thwarted and fulfilled; the psyche can be therefore understood as a 'congealment' of layers of experiences and losses (1997: 169). It is interesting to consider this idea of congealment in relation to debates on agency and structure such as the one outlined above in relation to Goffman's work; for Butler, the subject is never fully free to exert their agency and choose their actions, but rather one's desires and capabilities are coloured by previous experiences. Nor is a subject fully determined by the norms that inscribe their makeup, because for Butler, the self is in a continual process of transformation, influenced by encounters with others and experiences of life, and is therefore always 'at a temporal remove from its former appearance' (2004: 148). We can never fully know nor predict the outcomes of the psychic layering that occurs.

For Goffman, identification is a struggle between external imposed forces and a self that attempts to defend its inner territory in the face of these. In contrast, as detailed above, Butler's psychoanalytic and poststructural account of subjection provides a picture of identification in which the 'inside-outside', spatial metaphor of identification is problematized (Butler, 1997), and in which psychic struggles of desire that manifest in emotional and affective displays accompany this complex engagement.

## **Methods**

To illustrate these ideas, I drew on recent studies that adopt a narrative approach to the study of self and identity. The idea is that people are storytellers and tend to use a story form when making sense of events that have happened to them, people they know, and their own notions of self (Czarniawska, 1998; Watson, 2009). By producing narratives about who we are and what we are doing, we simultaneously construct our identities (Stockoe and

Edwards 2006: 56; Vásquez, 2007; Whittle, Mueller and Mangan, 2009). Of course, narrative approaches can be problematic; people can reconstruct identities in line with how they would like to see themselves and be seen by others (Whittle, Mueller and Mangan, 2009: 438). Narratives also tend to be limited to one person's account of the meaning that a set of events holds for them. Despite these limitations, the method has proved useful and in adopting it here, I draw on an autobiographical narrative written by a former inmate of Artane Industrial School, entitled *Fear of the Collar* (Touher, 2007).

I was interested in Touher's account of self in relation to his experiences with the institution (Pratt, 2000). I analyzed his account by close reading and highlighted such references (Hardy et al., 2000), drawing on insights from Butler and Goffman to make sense of these. The complexity of Touher's identifications with Artane was clear (Alvesson and Willmott, 2004; Hardy et al, 2000; Kondo, 1990) and in what follows, theoretical ideas are threaded through excerpts from Touher's texts in order to unpack this complexity (Kondo, 1990).

### **Mortifications of Self at Artane**

The autobiography examined for this paper, *Fear of the Collar*, details one boy's time at St. Joseph's Industrial School, Artane (Artane), the largest of its kind in Ireland. In total, 15,000 children passed through this school before its closure in 1969 (Ryan, 2009b: 105). As an example of enterprise, the child-staffed farm at Artane earned a substantial yearly income for the congregation of Brothers (Ryan, 2009b: 106; 202). The work system was ostensibly set up so that in addition to receiving a basic level of education and religious instruction, children would learn specific trades from an early age; these would ensure that children would find employment later on (Ryan, 2009b: 106). In reality, where tasks involved skills, these were often outdated and undocumented, leaving the adult school-leavers without relevant experience or qualifications (Ryan, 2009a; Touher, 2007). Each child was treated the same, and displays of individuality were punished. Attempts to communicate with outside authorities, including efforts to report cases of sexual abuse, were thwarted. Where they were successful, they were typically disbelieved (Ryan, 2009a). Children were warned by religious Brothers not to 'complain about us' to visitors (Touher 2007: 64). Paddy Touher was seven years old when he was sent to Artane, having been without parents in his early life. *Fear of the Collar* is his account of his time at the school and was first published in 1991.

In *On the Characteristics of Total Institutions*, one of the essays that make up *Asylums*, Goffman describes the 'mortifications' that accompany entry to such institutions. These reflect Touher's experiences at Artane. First was the 'dispossession of name, property and identity kit' in which individuals are subject to the removal of personal possessions and other markers of identity that are important for maintaining one's self-image. When the seven year old Touher arrived, he was relieved of the smart outfit in which his foster mother had dressed him and issued a grey uniform identical to that worn by the eight hundred other boys at the school. According to Touher, this began a process by which he gradually came to feel like 'an industrial school boy'. The 'imposition of degrading postures, stances and deference patterns' described by Goffman refers to the demeaning behaviours that inmates of total institutions can be subjected to, including having to defer to staff on trivial issues of conduct, and plead for small favours (1961: 31). Added to this for Goffman are indignities such as continuous teasing, name calling and other forms of degrading language, all of which force individuals into positions or 'stances' that are incompatible with their own sense of self. Throughout *Fear of the Collar*, Touher tells how he is repeatedly reminded that he is an orphan and therefore worthless (2007: 46). Classroom lessons were replete with such verbal abuses issued in front of other students, and were invariably reinforced with beatings. Reflecting on how he felt after these experiences, Touher would berate himself that 'I just can't do anything right' (ibid: 162), illustrating the struggles over self that Goffman describes.

Finally, Goffman discusses how inmates at total institutions can be subject to 'contaminative exposure' (1961: 33). Outside the institution, he notes, people have some freedom to

remove themselves from situations that might be damaging, while in a total institution this freedom is violated. The individual can, for example, be deprived of the usual private spaces in which to hide personal actions, and therefore be forced into humiliating exposure. The ability to remove oneself from cruel others is often absent, and physical and sexual attacks can be commonplace. At Artane, little discretion was available; between waking and sleeping, children as young as five were marshalled from dormitory to washrooms, to classes and onto mealtimes, mostly in enforced silence (Touher, 2007: 15). The school was poorly heated (ibid: 55), and children who worked in the fields or in workshops were frequently left in their dirty and wet work clothes (Ryan, 2009b: 209). Children were served meals en masse, all eight hundred boys in one refectory, so that the weaker ones would struggle to get enough to eat (ibid: 206). Regarding private spaces, thirty buckets lined up behind the handball alley served as toilets for eight hundred children until the 1950s. During the recent Commission investigation, former pupils noted how it was 'impossible to avoid physical punishment in Artane' (Ryan, 2009b: 114). The investigation found that uncontrolled physical abuse was inherent to the industrial school system such that it was accepted at all levels; it was part of the way the schools were run (Ryan, 2009b: 114, 156). The abuse was excessive, with leather straps, hurls (wooden sports bats) and other implements used by disciplining Brothers. This was certainly reflective of Touher's experience; his account is filled with being beaten for minor infringements. Normal, everyday actions were frequent occasions for savage punishment, such as being last to leave the washrooms (Touher, 2007: 28), giving a wrong answer in class, or mere accidents such as bed-wetting and soiling one's underwear by young children. In addition to physical contamination, Artane was an extreme example of the kinds of emotional and interpersonal infringements described by Goffman. Physical punishment could come at any time (Ryan, 2009b:163); a chaplain who had served at Artane for seven years described the atmosphere of the school as: 'very oppressive, and it seemed to me to engender a great fear, an atmosphere of fear in the boys, generally, either in anticipation of punishment or actually experiencing punishment' (Ryan, 2009b: 143). Sexual abuse of children by Brothers who were charged with their care was a chronic problem at Artane (Ryan, 2009b: 190; Touher, 2007: 48). More than one known child abuser lived at the school and occupied a position of authority, during each of the thirty years examined by the Ryan Report (Ryan, 2009b: 234). Touher's account is filled with incidents of abuse and rape, describing the prevalent fear of attack, with children lying awake crying at night or wetting their beds from fear as they slept; both instances resulting in further punishments. Touher's account tells of a self that was fundamentally changed as a result of these experiences, 'the Brothers that forced themselves on me harmed me much more than (those that beat him physically) ever did' (2007: 80)... 'they stole my dignity, revealed my nakedness, plundered my body' (ibid: 157). He describes the lasting effects of this abuse, 'my dreams were not childish dreams but shattered dreams of horror, filled with fear and violence... Fear tore through every part of me in those dreams' (ibid: 144). These dreams plagued Touher throughout his adult life.

### **The Self at Artane**

In the face of such horrific experiences, how does Touher describe his processes of self constitution? *Fear of the Collar* details how he struggled around maintaining a sense of self during his time at Artane. A number of ways emerge that parallel the kinds of secondary adjustments discussed by Goffman, who notes that people in total institutions can create alternative identities in relation to other, non-institutional, social entities (1961: 178).

In the first instance, Touher's struggle was marked by escape and fantasy. Every Saturday, the children were treated to a film screening, nicknamed 'the pictures'. These events were the highlight of the week at Artane and the films themselves formed the most popular topic of discussion among the boys. Incredible excitement accompanied Saturday afternoon's trips and 'the colossal buildup often surpassed the quality of the film itself' (ibid: 88). Touher describes how wonderful it was to be able to escape the reality of cold, damp surroundings and escape with *Batman*, *Laurel and Hardy* and other films, 'to me it was pure fantasy and it

helped me through many a dreary week' (ibid). His autobiography outlines his avid identification with the stars of the cinema: a desperate wish to escape the reality of being an Artaner. Touher describes how he and his friends would carefully reenact scenes from these films, referring to this as an illustration of how a space was carved out even amid the oppressive environment of the school. He writes, 'we never felt at a loss in Artane school to find things to do and we certainly made the most out of our situation at all times' (2007: 171), referring to these cinema games. Touher 'found great comfort and peace of mind watching the silver screen in those days of the great stars of the fifties... They were our heroes, our chaps, our stars and we followed their every move... I simply adored them and wanted desperately to be like them' (2007: 88). For Touher and his friends, it appears that the cinema represented an important way of protecting a sense of self, of providing the kind of 'elbow room' described by Goffman.

Besides the 'pictures', other important sources of self-constitution for Touher included a view of a self that was outside of Artane. As was common, he had been assigned to a family from the outside, the O'Gradys, who would come and visit him twice a year, taking him on day trips. He wrote about how he glimpsed a life on the outside through these experiences, and would fantasize about living it. At age eleven, Touher was sent on a visit to his former foster home in the Dublin mountains and enjoyed a sunny afternoon exploring his old haunts, playing in the fields with friends. He writes about how he kept the beauty of this treasured 'golden day' in his memory for a long time. Haunting his time at Artane was the shadow of a parallel self outside of the Industrial School; the identity that was denied by the oppressive position he had been forced into.

In addition to this 'outside self', Touher fantasized about a self that was successful and recognized by others as being 'good at something'. Despite being continually reminded by his teachers and carers of his lowly status as orphaned industrial school boy, he describes how he wanted to be a poet or writer. After watching films he would 'fantasise about being a star, so desperate was I to be good at something'. In his teens, Touher began work as an apprentice in the school's bakery in order to learn this trade and ready himself for adult life. He tells how he enjoyed this opportunity to prove himself away from the harsh beatings associated with the school classroom. He describes how he 'had always been self-motivated, driven by ambition', and outlines his hopes that this drive for success would help him to succeed in the baking trade (2007: 186). In Touher's account, this drive and confidence emerges in relation to his descriptions of self, at the same time as the harsh and cruel environment is painted. Overall, we see the kinds of territories of self described by Goffman, and there is a sense of the struggle that accompanied his defence of these.

### **The complexity of being a 'hardened Artaner'**

On closer examination of Touher's account of self, and the struggles that surrounded it, it appears that there was some clouding of the divide between the 'territory of self' that remained Touher's own, and the part of self that appeared to be colonized by the total institution in which he grew up. Aspects of this complexity are described next.

Touher describes the flashes of beauty and feeling that accompanied his sense of 'being an Artaner'. His account of his very first day in class illustrates how he was screamed at by 'Hellfire', the Brother who was teaching. Touher was mocked in front of his new schoolmates for being from the countryside, and felt ashamed and frightened. Part of this mockery involved the teacher ordering Touher's classmates to stand and sing a song, *Bhéar-mí-ó*, in order to 'show their appreciation' to the new boy. Despite the intended sarcasm, Touher describes how he was moved by this song and upon hearing it repeatedly in the years that followed, it came to have a special significance for him, 'to this day I can honestly say I love it the same as when I had it sung for me so very long ago in March 1950' (2007: 26). Music also appears as important in a later experience at Artane; Touher describes how, four years after joining the school, he had once again been visited by a Brother in the night. The

following morning, tired and frightened, he found himself last in the queue for the washbasins, a status that was normally accompanied by a beating. Completely disheartened, Touher stood by the wall with his hands above his head, the normal stance for those who were awaiting punishment, 'I simply wanted to scream, 'let me out of this evil place!'. He could hear that in the next room, a Brother had ordered all children to sing the hymn *Hail, Queen of Heaven*, as the previous night's bedwetters were marched to the laundry. Despite his utter dejection, he writes, 'and yet, as the huge dormitory was filled with the sound of almost two hundred boys singing, I was moved to tears. Without realizing it, I had a love-hate relationship with Artane' (2007: 155). Throughout the book, Touher describes such moments at Artane, and how the sound of hymns that he associated with this awful place could move him to tears.

As a second example of the complexity of Touher's relation with Artane, even as he suffered terribly under the rigid discipline imposed there, his account is replete with admiration for the military organization of the school. For example, he describes the drillmaster who taught the boys marching skills and who was nicknamed 'Driller the Killer'; 'he was a bloody terror... he put the full force of his strength behind the cane or leather... He mostly hit the lads across the face and head with his clenched fist or open hands.. He was savage'. In the same paragraph, Touher continues, 'as a drill instructor however, he was excellent... my fondest memories of those times are of Easter parades'. For Touher, such incidents of savagery were caught up in his most meaningful experiences at Artane, 'It was an incredible and moving experience to be part of a boy's army on parade, with Driller the Killer in command'. Again music accompanied this memory as he describes the playing of Irish Airs in the background, 'the Driller was at his supreme best, and I felt very proud to be an Artaner' (2007: 58).

Even as he suffered at Artane, Touher's fondness for the school paradoxically flourished, along with his appreciation of being part of something greater. This took a number of forms. Two years after entering the School, Touher notes that 'I was a hardened Artaner', with good friends and much laughing and teasing (2007: 43). His friendship with other boys marked his settling into Artane and with these friends, he joined some of the gangs that made up the student body, 'for enjoyment, fun and games on the playing fields' (2007: 131). In addition, Touher writes with fondness about the many rituals that accompanied life at Artane. Slang was rife: bread was 'yang', tea was 'slash' and every new Brother and boy was quickly assigned their own nickname (ibid: 30). Writing about meeting fellow Artaners even years after having left the school, Touher describes how they would reminisce about such rituals; a collective sense of being part of something had developed and Touher was compelled by this. While Touher writes with fondness of some of the kinder Brothers and the more skilled teachers who would help and encourage the boys, paradoxically he describes feeling kindly towards even the worst abusers (2007: 116). When it came time to leave, Touher describes his affection for this industrial school; 'after eight long, hard years at Artane, I guess the place had grown on me' (2007: 239). He writes about his loneliness at leaving, and how memories of his time at the school came back to him as he prepared to depart, 'Odd, really, to think that a place so full of regimented ways, with its brutal system and hard, tough discipline, would mean so much to me' (ibid: 240). Overall, he notes 'I felt that I was part of the institution and that in going I was losing part of myself' (ibid).

### **Discussion and Conclusion**

Artane industrial school represents an interesting example of the total institutions described by Goffman, and Touher's autobiography provides an in-depth account of a struggle of self within such an environment. Examining this struggle, it appears that the kinds of negotiations around territories of self, described by Goffman, marked Touher's experiences. We see a colonization of self take place, as this total institution enacts particular violations on its inmates, depriving them of dignity and space, and imposing a sense of worthlessness and hopelessness on its pupils. We see also the kinds of resistances, or 'secondary adjustments'

that Goffman outlines, where spaces are forged out in which alternative selves are conjured up and imagined, and through Touher's own words we can gain a sense of just how important these fantasies are in his struggles at Artane.

Even so, it appears upon closer examination that Touher's identifications with Artane are more complex still. This small child grew into a young man in this total institution, and the account presented in *Fear of the Collar* describes a mix of alienation and attachment to the organization. The findings presented above offer an illustration of how this child-worker's sense of self, in relation to Artane, was suffused with fear and pain, but also with joy and belonging. For example, despite the beatings and abuse, Touher reports feeling 'proud to be an Artaner' at times, describing the scale and achievements of this huge, self-sustaining organization, along with close friendships with other children and the kindness of many Brothers. At other times, he discusses the debilitating impact his time at Artane had on his subsequent sense of self. Articulating the paradox, he reflects that it was 'odd that a brutal, hard place would mean so much to me' (2007: 240).

Returning to the notion of self in relation to Goffman's work, rather than distinct territories of self that are either 'pure' in that they remain protected from colonization by the institution, or 'contaminated' in that the battle has been lost, we see a situation in which Touher is somewhat compelled into an attachment to this institution, even where he is quite aware of the damage it can cause. As Butler notes, the identifications that inform our sense of self are affective in nature, although this affect is necessarily ambiguous. Artane provided a sense of belonging and attachment, and Touher appears to embrace it for these reasons, despite the injuries and violations that the place inflicts upon him. In relation to the study of total institutions, it appears that affective attachments mark peoples' engagements with oppressive forms of power, in complex ways. Theoretically, this shifts our attention from uncovering territories of self, and the back-and-forth struggles that occur over these, to the ways in which our lives are marked by investments in certain phenomena that hold power over us.

These ideas reflect existing studies that draw on Lacanian approaches to the topic of self and subjectivity within organizations (e.g. Driver, 2005; 2009; Harding, 2007; Roberts, 2005; Stavrakakis, 2008). As an example of how affect can inscribe even the most unlikely scenarios, Stavrakakis points to the Milgram experiments, during which a sense of attachment to the experimenter was expressed by subjects of the study. Despite the fact that the experimenter was asking the participants to inflict pain on others, and to transgress their own sense of what was right, participants appeared to develop strong emotional ties with the experimenter and were unwilling to hurt his feelings (Milgram 2005: 152, cited in Stavrakakis 2008: 1051). For Stavrakakis, this points to the ways in which we can desire, and be drawn to, that which simultaneously subjects us to power, even where this is harmful to us. Such perspectives highlight how selfhood is marked by complex oscillations between attachment and alienation, love and hate, abjection and belonging. We are often oblivious to these investments, but for the researcher, emotional expressions can help understand such instances. Without an attention to affect in the methodologies used by organizational researchers therefore, we cannot fully understand the ways in which peoples' identifications and self-concepts are influenced by certain forms of power.

If organization scholars are to study instances of large scale suffering that are enabled by feats of management and organization, then much work is required into how forms of power play out in such settings. By deepening our understanding of the ways in which processes of self can come to be caught up in these practices, this paper provides suggestions towards ways in which Goffman's work on the total institution can be reignited in light of recent insights from the study of identification. Complex attachments can cause both pain and injury, in addition to providing a desired sense of recognition and self. More empirical

engagement with these ideas in the context of organization studies has been called for (Stavrakakis, 2008). The current paper represents one such study.

*Conference presentation supported by NUI Galway's Millennium Fund*

### **References:**

- Alvesson, M. & Willmott, H. (2004) Identity Regulation as Organizational Control: Producing the Appropriate Individual. In: Organizational Identity, Hatch M. J. & M. Schultz (eds.): 436-465. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Burrell, G. (1984). 'Sex and Organizational Analysis', *Organization Studies*, 5(2): 97:118
- Butler, J. (1990). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. London: Routledge.
- Butler, J. (1997). *The psychic life of power: Theories in subjection*. London: Routledge.
- Butler, J. (2004). *Undoing gender*. New York: Routledge.
- Clegg, S. (2006). 'Why is organization theory so ignorant? The neglect of total institutions', *Journal of Management Inquiry*, 15(4): 426-430
- Dennis, A. and P.J. Martin (2005). 'Symbolic Interactionism and the Concept of Power', *British Journal of Sociology*, 56(2): 191-213
- Czarniawska, B. (1998). *A Narrative Approach to Organization Studies*. London: Sage.
- Driver, M. (2005). 'From empty speech to full speech? Reconceptualizing spirituality in organizations based on a psychoanalytically-grounded understanding of the self', *Human Relations*, 58(9): 1091-1110
- Driver, M. (2009). 'Encountering the Arugula Leaf: The Failure of the Imaginary and its Implications for Research on Identity in Organizations'. *Organization*, (16): 487-504.
- Ferguson, H. (2007). 'Abuse and Looked After Children as "Moral Dirt": Child Abuse and Institutional Care in Historical Perspective', *Journal of Social Policy*, 36 (1): 123-139.
- Ferriter, D. (2009). Ferriter Report. In Ryan (ed). CICA Vol V: pp 1-37. Available: <http://www.childabusecommission.ie/rpt/pdfs/> Access date: 8th September 2010.
- Fotaki, M. (2007). 'The ir/rationality of killing the 'Other'? Of genocide, silence and management', 23rd EGOS Colloquium presented in the stream on 'Genocide, individuals and organization: choices, actions and consequences for contemporary contexts', 5-7th July, Vienna.
- Giocalone, R.A. and Rosenfeld, P. (1991). *Applied impression management: How image-making affects managerial decisions*. London: Sage.
- Goffman, E. (1961). *Asylums: Essays on the social situation of mental patients and other inmates*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Goffman, E. (1968). *Stigma: Notes on the management of spoiled identity*. London: Penguin.
- Goffman, E. (1971). *Relations in Public: Microstudies of the Public Order*. NY: Basic Books.
- Hall, S. (2000). 'Who needs "identity"?' in *Identity: A reader*. du Gay, P., Evans, J. and Redman, P. (eds), London, Sage/The Open University, 15-31.
- Harding, N. (2007). 'On Lacan and the "Becoming-ness" of Organizations/ Selves'. *Organization Studies* 28(11): 1761-1773.
- Hardy, C., Palmer, I. & Phillips, N. (2000). Discourse as a strategic resource. *Human Relations*, 53, 9, 1227-1248.
- Hardy C. and Clegg S. (2006). 'Some dare call it power', in *Sage Handbook of Organization Studies*, SAGE Publications, London, UK, pp. 754-775.
- Hook, D. (2007). *Foucault, psychology, and the analytics of power*. Hampshire: Palgrave.
- Jenkins, R. (2008) 'Erving Goffman: A Major Theorist of Power?', *Journal of Power*, 1(2): 157-68.
- Kondo, D. (1990). *Crafting Selves: Power, Gender and Discourses of Identity in a Japanese Workplace*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- Lemert, C. and Branaman, A. (1996). *The Goffman Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell.

- Lloyd, M. (2007). *Judith Butler: From Norms to Politics*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Mangham, I. and Overington, M.A. (1987). *Organizations as theatre: A social psychology of dramatic appearances*. Chichester: Wiley.
- Milgram, S. (2005) *Obedience to authority*. London: Pinter & Martin Ltd (Originally published 1974)
- Morgan, D. (2009). Chapter 3: Society and the Schools. In Ryan (2009), CICA Vol. 4: pp 201-244. Available: <http://www.childabusecommission.ie/rpt/pdfs/CICA-VOL4-09.PDF> Access date: 8th September 2010.
- O'Connell, T. and Smyth, D (2006) Real Convergence within the European Union: the Case of Ireland. In *Living Standards and the wealth of nations: success and failures in real convergence*. Leslek Balcerowicz and Fisher, Stanley (Eds.), MIT Press: Cambridge, MA.
- O'Regan, E. (2010), Lack of social workers holds up enforcing of Ryan report, Irish Independent, 8<sup>th</sup> September 2010. Available: <http://www.independent.ie/national-news/lack-of-social-workers-holds-up-enforcing-of-ryan-report-2329047.html>, Access date: 8<sup>th</sup> September 2010.
- Paterniti, D. (2000). 'The Micropolitics of Identity in Adverse Circumstance: A Study of Identity Making in a Total Institution', *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 29: 93-119
- Pratt, M. (2000). The good, the bad, and the ambivalent: managing identification among amway distributors, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, (45): 456-493.
- Roberts, J. (2005). 'The Power of the "Imaginary" in Disciplinary Processes.' *Organization* 12(5): 619-642.
- Ryan, S. (2009a). Executive Summary. In report of the Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (CICA). Dublin, The Stationary Office. Available at: <http://www.childabusecommission.ie/> (Accessed: 10th June 2010).
- Ryan, S. (2009b) Chapter 7: St Joseph's Industrial School, Artane ('Artane'), 1870–1969. In CICA Vol 1: pp 105-284. Available: <http://www.childabusecommission.ie/rpt/pdfs/CICA-VOL1-07.PDF> Access date: 8th September 2010
- Ryan S. (2009c) Chapter 6: The Congregation of Christian Brothers, CICA Vol I: pp 69-104. Available: <http://www.childabusecommission.ie/rpt/pdfs/CICA-VOL1-06.PDF> Access date: 8th September 2010.
- Saffold, G.S. (1988). 'Culture traits, strength and organisational performance: moving beyond "strong" culture', *Academy of Management Review*, 13(4): 546-558.
- Scanlan, M. (2006). *Culture and Customs of Ireland*. Greenwood Press, Westport, CT, US.
- Scott, S. (2010). 'Revisiting the Total Institution: Performative Regulation in the Reinventive Institution', *Sociology* (44): 213-232
- Shenkar, O. (1996). 'The Firm as a total institution: Reflections on the Chinese state enterprise'. *Organization Studies*, 17(6), 885-907
- Stavrakakis, Y. (2002). 'Encircling the political: towards a Lacanian political theory', in Jaques Lacan: critical evaluations in cultural theory. S. Zizek (ed). London, Routledge. 3: Society, Politics, Ideology: 274-305.
- Stavrakakis, Y. (2008). 'Subjectivity and the Organized Other: Between Symbolic Authority and Fantasmatic Enjoyment.' *Organization Studies* (29): 1037-1059.
- Stockoe, E. and Edwards, D. (2006) 'Story Formulations in Talk-in-Interaction', *Narrative Inquiry* 16(1): 56–65.
- Touher, P. (2007). *Fear of the Collar*. London: Ebury Publishing.
- Tracy, S. (2000). 'Becoming a Character for Commerce : Emotion Labor, Self-Subordination, and Discursive Construction of Identity in a Total Institution'. *Management Communication Quarterly*, 14(1): 90-128
- Vasquez, C. (2007). 'Moral stance in the workplace narratives of novices'. *Discourse Studies*, 9(5), 653-675
- Wallace, S. (1971), 'Introduction: On The Totality of Institutions', in Wallace, S. (ed.), *Total Institutions*, Transaction Books, New Brunswick
- Watson, T.J. (2009). 'Narrative life story and the management of identity: a case study in autobiographical identity work', *Human Relations*, 62(3): 1-28

Whittle, A., Mueller, F. & Mangan, A. (2009) 'Storytelling and "Character": Victims, villains and heroes in a case of technological change', *Organization*, 16(3): 425-442.